

**THE BOUNDARIES OF
INVESTMENT ARBITRATION**

**THE USE OF TRADE AND EUROPEAN
HUMAN RIGHTS LAW IN
INVESTOR-STATE DISPUTES**

José E. Alvarez

JURIS

Questions About This Publication

For assistance with shipments, billing or other customer service matters, please call our Customer Services Department at:

1-631-350-2100

To obtain a copy of this book, call our Sales Department:

1-631-351-5430

Fax: 1-631-673-9117

Toll Free Order Line:

1-800-887-4064 (United States & Canada)

See our webpage about this book:
www.arbitrationlaw.com

COPYRIGHT 2018
JurisNet, LLC

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced in any form or by any electronic or mechanical means including information storage and retrieval systems without permission in writing from the publisher.

Printed in the United States of America
ISBN 978-1-944825-24-9

JurisNet, LLC
71 New Street
Huntington, New York 11743
USA
www.arbitrationlaw.com

CONTENTS

ABOUT THE AUTHOR	ix
Chapter 1	1
Introduction: Boundary Crossings and Why They Occur	
A. The Reality of Boundary Crossings	1
B. The Entry Points for Trade/European Human Rights Boundary Crossings	5
C. What Motivates Investor-State Arbitrators to Engage in Boundary Crossings?	18
D. Scholars and Boundary Crossings.....	24
Chapter 2	41
The Use (and Misuse) of European Human Rights Law by Investor-State Arbitrators	
A. Introduction	41
B. A Survey of European Human Rights Citations in ISDS Case Law	47
C. Why Is This Happening?	82
D. A Case Study of <i>Philip Morris v. Uruguay</i>	87
E. Tentative Conclusions	107
1. Deracinated, Inconsistent Referrals to ECHR Balancing Principles	107
2. Explaining the “Nature” of the Two Regimes	109
3. Blurring the Lines between “Property,” “Possessions,” and “Investments”	113
4. Demarking the Line between Compensable Expropriation and Legitimate Regulation.....	115
5. Determining the Meanings of FET	118
6. Ensuring a Fair Trial or Access to Court	120
7. Other Issues	121

CONTENTS

Chapter 3	125
The Use (and Misuse) of Trade Law by Investor-State Arbitrators	
A. Introduction	125
B. A Survey of Trade Law Citations in ISDS	
Case Law	136
1. WTO References under NAFTA’s Chapter Eleven....	136
2. WTO References Beyond the NAFTA	170
C. How Much “Trade-Infused” Investment Law Is There?.....	186
Chapter 4	201
The Promise and Hazards of “Public Law” Boundary Crossings	
A. Introduction	201
B. Comparing European Human Rights and WTO References	204
C. When Are ECHR or WTO Boundary Crossings Appropriate?.....	228
D. Do Boundary Crossings Matter?	247
E. Conclusion.....	252
BIBLIOGRAPHY	259
APPENDICES AND TABLES	267
APPENDIX I: A List of 65 ISDS Rulings with One or More ECHR/ECtHR References	269
TABLE I: Significant European Human Rights References in ISDS Rulings	275
APPENDIX II: A List of 58 ISDS Rulings with One or More GATT/WTO References	303
APPENDIX III: A List of 65 ISDS Rulings with One or More GATT/WTO References	307
TABLE II: Significant GATT/WTO References in ISDS Rulings	311