

# **ARBITRATING ARMED CONFLICT**

**DECISIONS OF THE  
ISRAEL-LEBANON  
MONITORING GROUP**

**ADIR WALDMAN**

**Jp**  
**Juris**

COPYRIGHT © 2003  
by Juris Publishing, Inc.

All Rights Reserved  
Printed in the United States of America

ISBN #1-929446-33-0

Juris Publishing, Inc.  
71 New Street  
Huntington, NY 11743  
[www.jurispub.com](http://www.jurispub.com)

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

|   | Page |
|---|------|
| Introduction.....   | 1    |
| Map .....   | 9    |
| <br><b>Chapter 1. HISTORICAL BACKGROUND</b>   |      |
| A. Introduction.....  | 11   |
| B. The Prelude: Previous Attempts to Control the Violence in<br>Lebanon and Israeli-Syrian Interactions in the Lebanese<br>Arena Prior to 1996..... | 17   |
| C. The Breakdown of the 1993 Understanding and Operation<br>Grapes of Wrath.....  | 21   |
| <br><b>Chapter 2. THE APRIL AGREEMENT</b>   |      |
| A. A Written Agreement to Fight a Limited War.....  | 27   |
| B. The Israel-Lebanon Monitoring Group.....   | 31   |
| C. The Conflict Under the April Agreement .....   | 36   |
| D. Testing the Agreement in the Web of International Law.....   | 41   |
| E. The Israel-Lebanon Monitoring Group as a Judicial Institution .....  | 44   |
| 1. Logistics and Procedure .....  | 44   |
| 2. Fostering Adherence to the Legal Convention.....   | 53   |
| <br><b>Chapter 3. ILMG PUBLIC STATEMENTS:<br/>RECORDING A JURISPRUDENCE</b>   |      |
| A. Introduction.....  | 59   |
| B. Increasing Competency.....   | 61   |
| C. Understanding the ILMG Through Its Public Statements .....   | 63   |
| D. Moving from the Internal Report to the Public Statement:<br>A Case Study .....   | 74   |
| E. Establishing Principles and Jurisprudence.....   | 77   |
| 1. Rules of Procedure .....   | 77   |
| 2. Substantive Principles .....   | 79   |
| 3. Jurisprudence on Specific Issues.....  | 81   |
| a. The Meaning of “Civilian” .....  | 82   |
| b. The Meaning of “Civilian Populated Area”.....  | 86   |
| c. Returning Fire Emanating From Civilian<br>Populated Areas .....  | 90   |
| F. Unprocessable Complaints — Limited Jurisdiction<br>and the Effectiveness of the Legal System .....   | 93   |

|  |            |
|--|------------|
| <b>Chapter 4. LEGAL REALISM: THE MUTUAL CORRELATION<br/>BETWEEN REGIONAL DEVELOPMENTS AND THE ILMG<br/>PROCEEDINGS</b> |            |
| A. Legal Realism .....   | 97         |
| B. The Situation After February 2000 .....   | 101        |
| <b>Chapter 5. UNDERSTANDING THE APRIL AGREEMENT<br/>IN THE CONTEXT OF INTERNATIONAL LAW</b>                            |            |
| A. Converging on a Legal Arrangement to Avoid War.....   | 105        |
| B. The Equilibrium Convergence Point: Civilian Immunity<br>and the Laws of War .....                                   | 110        |
| C. The Role of the ILMG in Preserving the 1996 System.....   | 112        |
| D. The Lens of the International Legal Scholar.....  | 120        |
| <b>Appendix A. PROTOCOL ON THE WORKING RULES<br/>FOR THE ISRAEL-LEBANON MONITORING GROUP .....</b>                     | <b>127</b> |
| <b>Appendix B. SAMPLE INTERNAL REPORT OF THE<br/>ISRAEL-LEBANON MONITORING GROUP .....</b>                             | <b>133</b> |
| <b>Appendix C. PUBLIC STATEMENTS OF THE<br/>ISRAEL-LEBANON MONITORING GROUP.....</b>                                   | <b>143</b> |
| <b>Index.....</b>  | <b>299</b> |