

**International Arbitration Institute  
Institut pour l'Arbitrage International**

**The Review of  
International Arbitral Awards**

---

**IAI Forum  
Dijon – 12–14 September 2008**

**General Editor: Emmanuel Gaillard**

Reference editor: Nanou Leleu-Knobil

**JURIS**

**Questions About This Publication**

For assistance with shipments, billing or other customer service matters, please call our Customer Services Department at: +1-631-350-0200.

To obtain a copy of this book in the United States and Canada  
Call our Toll Free Order Line: +1-800-887-4064 or Fax: +1-631-351-5712

To obtain a copy of this book in Switzerland, Germany and Austria  
Call +41 031 300 66 66

This book may be cited as:

THE REVIEW OF INTERNATIONAL ARBITRAL AWARDS,  
IAI SERIES NO. 6  
(E. Gaillard ed., 2010)

For any inquiry regarding these materials or the IAI, an organization created under the auspices of the Comité Français de l'Arbitrage (CFA), you may contact Nanou Leleu-Knobil ([nleleuknobil@shearman.com](mailto:nleleuknobil@shearman.com)).

COPYRIGHT © 2010

by

JurisNet, LLC

and

International Arbitration Institute (IAI)

All Rights Reserved.

Printed in the United States of America

ISBN: 978-1-933833-33-0

JurisNet, LLC

71 New Street

Huntington, New York 11743

USA

[www.arbitrationlaw.com](http://www.arbitrationlaw.com)

---

# THE REVIEW OF INTERNATIONAL ARBITRAL AWARDS

---

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION .....	<i>Emmanuel Gaillard</i>	1	
<b><i>PART I</i></b>			
<b>THE REVIEW OF ARBITRAL AWARDS BY DOMESTIC COURTS .....</b>			5
Introductory Report.....	<i>Bernard Hanotiau &amp; Olivier Caprasse</i>	7	
France .....	<i>Dominique Hascher</i>	97	
United States.....	<i>Justice Stephen G. Breyer</i>	111	
England.....	<i>Jonathan Mance</i>	119	
Sweden.....	<i>Roland Halvorsen</i>	145	
Discussion.....		155	
Key Note Speech – Is There a Need to Revise the New York Convention? .....	V.V. Veeder	183	
<b><i>PART II</i></b>			
<b>THE REVIEW OF ARBITRAL AWARDS IN THE ICSID SYSTEM.....</b>			195
Reflections on the Control Mechanism of the ICSID System .....	<i>W. Michael Reisman</i>	197	

Table of Contents

Review of the Arbitral Tribunal’s Jurisdiction in ICSID Arbitration.....	<i>Sir Franklin Berman</i>	253
Review of ICSID Awards Based on a Manifest Excess of Powers .....	<i>Ahmed El-Kosheri</i>	265
Failure to State Reasons in ICSID Awards .....	<i>Gilbert Guillaume</i>	271
Is there a Need to Establish a Permanent Review Body?.....	<i>Andreas Bucher</i>	285
Discussion.....		299
<i>ANNEXES</i> .....		337
<b>ANNEX 1</b>		
The Review of International Arbitral Awards by Domestic Courts – France <i>Dominique Hascher</i> Original contribution in French .....		339
<b>ANNEX 2</b>		
Failure to State Reasons in ICSID Awards <i>Gilbert Guillaume</i> Original contribution in French .....		349
<b>ANNEX 3</b>		
The Review of International Arbitral Awards by Domestic Courts – Original French excerpts of the discussion.....		359
<b>ANNEX 4</b>		
The Review of Arbitral Awards in the ICSID System – Original French excerpts of the discussion.....		373

<b>ANNEX 5</b>	
European Court of Justice Case No. C-126/97, June 1, 1999, Eco Swiss China Time Ltd. v. Benetton International N.V. ....	391
<b>ANNEX 6</b>	
Brussels Court of First Instance, March 8, 2007, SNF SAS v. Cytec Industrie. ....	403
<b>ANNEX 7</b>	
Paris Court of Appeal, March 23, 2006, SNF SAS v. Cytec Industries BV. ....	425
<b>ANNEX 8</b>	
French Cour de cassation, June 4, 2008, SNF SAS v. CYTEC Industries BV. ....	435
<b>ANNEX 9</b>	
Swiss Federal Tribunal, March 8, 2006, Case No. 4P.278/2005. ....	439
<b>ANNEX 10</b>	
Hall Street Associates, L.L.C. v. Mattel, Inc., 552 U.S. 576 (2008). ....	451
<b>ANNEX 11</b>	
List of Participants to the IAI Forum Held in Vougeot on September 12–14, 2008. ....	465
<b>ANNEX 12</b>	
Table of Authorities. ....	469
<b>ANNEX 13</b>	
Table of Abbreviations. ....	497

