

INVESTMENT ARBITRATION AND THE ENERGY CHARTER TREATY

Edited by
Clarisse Ribeiro



ARBITRATION INSTITUTE
OF THE STOCKHOLM CHAMBER OF COMMERCE



JurisNet, LLC

Questions About This Publication

For assistance with shipments, billing or other customer service matters,
please call our Customer Services Department at:

1-631-350-0200

To obtain a copy of this book, call our Sales Department:

1-631-351-5430

Fax: 1-631-351-5712

Toll Free Order Line:

1-800-887-4064 (United States & Canada)

See our web page about this book:

<http://www.arbitrationlaw.com>

COPYRIGHT © 2006
by JurisNet, LLC

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced in any form
or by any electronic or mechanical means including information storage and
retrieval systems without permission in writing from the publisher.

All Rights Reserved
Printed in the United States of America

ISBN 1-929446-94-2

JurisNet, LLC
71 New Street
Huntington, New York 11743
USA
www.arbitrationlaw.com

CONTENTS

| | |
|---|-----------|
| Foreword | vii |
| Remarks by Judge S. Schwebel | ix |
| Editor's Preface..... | xi |
| List of Contributors..... | xv |
| Chapter 1 - Introduction to the Energy Charter Treaty (ECT) | 1 |
| Introduction <i>Dr. Hans Corell</i> | 1 |
| Part 1 - The Energy Charter Treaty: More Than a MIT <i>Graham Coop</i> | 3 |
| Part 2 - The Dispute Settlement Mechanisms of the Energy Charter Treaty <i>Laurent Gouiffès</i> | 22 |
| Chapter 2 - Investments and Investors Covered by the ECT and other Investment Protection Treaties | 51 |
| Introduction <i>Antonio R. Parra</i> | 51 |
| Part 1 - Investments and Investors Covered by the Energy Charter Treaty <i>Emmanuel Gaillard</i> | 54 |
| Part 2 - The Limits of Protection for Investments and Investors under the Energy Charter Treaty <i>Stephen Jagusch & Anthony Sinclair</i> | 73 |

| | |
|--|----------------|
| Chapter 3 – The Concept of Expropriation under the ECT and other Investment Protection Treaties | 105 |
| Introduction: | |
| <i>Sergei N. Lebedev</i> | <i>105</i> |
| Part 1 – Rapport: The Concept of Expropriation under the ECT and other Investment Protection Treaties | |
| <i>Christoph H. Schreuer</i> | <i>108</i> |
| Part 2 – Comments on the Rapport | <i>159</i> |
| I – Indirect Expropriation and the Right of the Governments to Regulate Criteria to Articulate the Difference | |
| <i>Katia Yannaca-Small</i> | <i>159</i> |
| II – The Distinction Between Lawful and Unlawful Expropriation | |
| <i>Audley Sheppard.....</i> | <i>169</i> |
| Chapter 4 – The Relationship Between Contractual Claims and Claims under the ECT and other Investment Protection Treaties | 201 |
| Introduction: Treaty versus Contract Claims | |
| <i>Gabrielle Kaufmann-Kohler</i> | <i>201</i> |
| Part 1 – Contract Claims under the Energy Charter Treaty’s Umbrella Clause: Original Intentions versus Emerging Jurisprudence | |
| <i>Thomas W. Wälde</i> | <i>205</i> |
| Part 2 – Multiple Judicial Proceedings and the Energy Charter Treaty | |
| <i>Christer Söderlund.....</i> | <i>237</i> |

| | |
|--|------------|
| Chapter 5 – State Responsibility under the ECT and other Investment Protection Treaties | 257 |
| Introduction: Applicable Law to State Responsibility under the Energy Charter Treaty and other Investment Protection Treaties <i>Karl-Heinz Böckstiegel</i> | <i>257</i> |
| Part 1 – State Responsibility and Investment Arbitration <i>Kaj Hobér</i> | <i>261</i> |
| Part 2 – State Responsibility under the Energy Charter Treaty and other Investment Protection Treaties <i>Anatoly S. Martynov</i> | <i>290</i> |
| Chapter 6 – Arbitration under the ECT and other Investment Protection Treaties | 299 |
| Introduction: Parallel Proceedings: The Issues and (Where Are?) the Solutions <i>Michael Polkinghorne</i> | <i>299</i> |
| Part 1 – Parallel Arbitration Tribunals and Awards <i>Bernardo M. Cremades</i> | <i>304</i> |
| Part 2 – The Nykomb Case in the Light of Recent ICSID Jurisprudence <i>Richard Happ</i> | <i>315</i> |
| Appendix – Awards Rendered under ECT | |
| Appendix 1 – Nykomb v. Latvia..... | AP1-1 |
| 1. Introduction..... | AP1-3 |
| 2. Jurisdiction..... | AP1-12 |
| 3. General background | AP1-20 |
| 4. The legal basis for the claims against the Republic | AP1-52 |
| 5. Assessment of losses or damages | AP1-67 |

| | | |
|--|--|---------|
| 6. | Allocation and allowability of costs | AP1-73 |
| 7. | Arbitral award..... | AP1-76 |
| Appendix 2 – Petrobart v. Kyrgyzstan..... | | AP2-1 |
| I. | The contract | AP2-3 |
| II. | Relevant facts..... | AP2-4 |
| III. | The Foreign Investment Law and proceedings regarding that law | AP2-10 |
| IV. | The Energy Charter Treaty | AP2-13 |
| V. | Proceedings..... | AP2-24 |
| VI. | Claims | AP2-28 |
| VII. | Grounds and arguments..... | AP2-29 |
| VIII. | Reasons..... | AP2-97 |
| Appendix 3 – Plama v. Bulgaria (Decision on Jurisdiction) | | AP3-1 |
| I. | Procedure | AP3-3 |
| II. | Background facts..... | AP3-7 |
| III. | The submissions of the parties on jurisdiction..... | AP3-14 |
| IV. | Examination of the parties’ submissions..... | AP3-37 |
| V. | The decision..... | AP3-86 |
| Index | | INDEX-1 |

Appendix topics on CD-ROM include:

ECT and Related Instruments
 SCC Arbitration Rules
 ICSID Arbitration Rules
 UNCITRAL Arbitration Rules