

**International Arbitration Institute  
Institut pour l'Arbitrage International**

**Annulment  
of  
ICSID Awards**

---

**A Joint IAI-ASIL Conference  
Washington, D.C. – April 1, 2003**

**General Editor: Emmanuel Gaillard**

Edited by Emmanuel Gaillard and Yas Banifatemi

**JURIS**

### **Questions About This Publication**

For assistance with shipments, billing or other customer service matters, please call our Customer Services Department at: 1-631-350-2100.

To obtain a copy of this book, call our Sales Department:

1-631-351-5430

Fax: 1-631-351-5712

Toll Free Order Line:

1-800-887-4064 (United States & Canada)

See our web page about this book:

[www.jurispub.com](http://www.jurispub.com)

This book may be cited as:

IAI INTERNATIONAL ARBITRATION SERIES No. 1,  
ANNULMENT OF ICSID AWARDS (E. Gaillard and Y. Banifatemi eds. 2004)

For any inquiry regarding these materials or regarding the IAI, an organization created under the auspices of the Comité Français de l'Arbitrage (CFA), you may contact Nanou Leleu-Knobil ([nleleuknobil@shearman.com](mailto:nleleuknobil@shearman.com)).

COPYRIGHT © 2004

by

JurisNet, LLC

and

International Arbitration Institute

---

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced in any form or by any electronic or mechanical means including information storage and retrieval systems without permission in writing from the publisher.

---

All Rights Reserved

Printed in the United States of America

ISBN 1-929446-61-6

Juris Publishing, Inc.

71 New Street

Huntington, New York 11743

USA

[www.jurispub.com](http://www.jurispub.com)

---

# ANNULMENT OF ICSID AWARDS

---

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

FOREWORD .....	<i>Charles N. Brower</i>	1
INTRODUCTION .....	<i>Emmanuel Gaillard</i>	5
 <i>PART I</i>		
GENERAL FEATURES OF ICSID ANNULMENT PROCEEDINGS .....		9
Article 52 of the Washington Convention – A Brief Introduction.....	<i>Hans Van Houtte</i>	11
Three Generations of ICSID Annulment Proceedings.....	<i>Christoph Schreuer</i>	17
Finality at What Cost? The Decision of the <i>Ad Hoc</i> Committee in <i>Wena Hotels v. Egypt</i> .....	<i>Eric A. Schwartz</i>	43
Litigating Annulment Proceedings – The <i>Vivendi</i> Matter: Contract and Treaty Claims .....	<i>Bernardo M. Cremades</i>	87
The <i>Vivendi</i> Annulment Decision and the Lessons for Future ICSID Arbitrations – The Applicants’ Perspective .....	<i>Stanimir A. Alexandrov</i>	97
<i>Vivendi v. Argentina</i> : on the Admissibility of Requests for Partial Annulment and the Ground of a Manifest Excess of Powers .....	<i>Carlos Ignacio Suarez Anzorena</i>	123
Stay of Enforcement of the Arbitral Award Pending ICSID Annulment Proceedings.....	<i>Paul D. Friedland</i>	177

Table of Contents

**PART II**

<b>THE REVIEW OF ICSID ARBITRAL AWARDS .....</b>	<b>187</b>
Annulment of ICSID Awards in Contract and Treaty Arbitrations: Are There Differences? .. <i>Gabrielle Kaufmann-Kohler</i>	189
The Extent of Review of the Applicable Law in Investment Treaty Arbitration .....	<i>Emmanuel Gaillard</i> 223
To What Extent Can an <i>Ad Hoc</i> Committee Review the Factual Findings of an Arbitral Tribunal .....	<i>Pierre Mayer</i> 243
To What Extent May an <i>Ad Hoc</i> Committee Review the Factual Findings of an Arbitral Tribunal Based on a Procedural Error? .....	<i>Peter D. Trooboff</i> 251
Setting Aside Additional Facility Awards: the <i>Metalclad</i> Case .....	<i>Henri C. Alvarez</i> 267
The Introduction of an Appellate Mechanism: the U.S. Trade Act of 2002 .....	<i>Barton Legum</i> 289
Concluding Remarks.....	<i>Pierre Lalive</i> 297

**ANNEXES**

**ANNEX 1**

<i>Wena Hotels Limited v. Arab Republic of Egypt</i> , Award of December 8, 2000	317
----------------------------------------------------------------------------------	-----

**ANNEX 2**

<i>Wena Hotels Limited v. Arab Republic of Egypt</i> , Decision of the <i>Ad Hoc</i> Committee, February 5, 2002	371
------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	-----

**ANNEX 3**

<i>Compañía de Aguas del Aconquija S.A. and Compagnie Générale des Eaux v. Argentine Republic</i> , Award of November 21, 2000	403
--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	-----

**ANNEX 4**

*Compañía de Aguas del Aconquija S.A. and Vivendi Universal  
(formerly Compagnie Générale des Eaux) v. Argentine Republic,*  
Decision of the *Ad Hoc* Committee, July 3, 2002 447

**ANNEX 5**

List of Participants to the IAI-ASIL Conference Held in  
Washington, D.C. on April 1, 2003 493

