

EMPLOYMENT ARBITRATION

SECOND EDITION

By

Thomas E. Carbonneau
Orlando Distinguished Professor of Law
Penn State University

A Publication of the Penn State Institute
of Arbitration Law and Practice



JurisNet, LLC

Questions About This Publication

For assistance with shipments, billing or other customer service matters,
please call our Customer Services Department at:

1-631-350-0200

To obtain a copy of this book, call our Sales Department:

1-631-351-5430

Fax: 1-631-351-5712

Toll Free Order Line:

1-800-887-4064 (United States & Canada)

See our web page about this book:

<http://www.arbitrationlaw.com>

COPYRIGHT © 2006
by JurisNet, LLC

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced in any form or by any
electronic or mechanical means including information storage and retrieval systems
without permission in writing from the publisher.

All Rights Reserved
Printed in the United States of America
ISBN 1-929446-66-7

JurisNet, LLC
71 New Street
Huntington, New York 11743
USA
www.arbitrationlaw.com

SUMMARY TABLE OF CONTENTS

Dedication	iii
Preface	xiii
Acknowledgments	xv
Section I.	An Introduction to the Process and the Issues	1
Section II.	Arbitration: A Definition	11
Section III.	The Law of Arbitration: Basic Concepts	29
Section IV.	A Critical Political Assessment	53
Section V.	The Fountainhead Cases	81
Section VI.	The Employment Contract Exclusion (FAA §1)	107
Section VII.	Fairness in the Employment Arbitration Contract	137
Section VIII.	The Allocation of Costs in Employment Arbitration Agreements	167
Section IX.	The Defense of Unconscionability	183
Section X.	The Effect of an Employment Arbitration Agreement on EEOC Jurisdiction	231
Section XI.	Employment Arbitration Agreements and Third-Party Beneficiaries	253
Section XII.	The Basic Judicial Position.....	269
Section XIII.	Minority Judicial Positions.....	321
Section XIV.	Aspects of the Continuing Debate on the Arbitrability of Title VII Claims.....	389
Section XV.	The Settlements in the Smith Barney and Merrill Lynch Class Action Lawsuits.....	421

SUMMARY TABLE OF CONTENTS

Section XVI.	The U.S. Supreme Court Decision in <i>Wright</i>	429
Section XVII.	“Makeshift” Employment Arbitration Agreements.....	437
Section XVIII.	The Institutional Position: Integrating the Legal Doctrine into Corporate Policy.....	457
Section XIX.	A Model Agreement and Arbitral Process.....	521
	Index and Table of Cases.....	531

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Dedication	iii
Preface	xiii
Acknowledgments	xv
Section I. An Introduction to the Process and the Issues	1
Section II. Arbitration: A Definition	11
(i) Its Appeal to the Commercial Community	12
(ii) The Reality of Its Operation	13
(iii) The Actual Operation	17
1. “Basic Organization”	17
2. “Arbitrators and Disclosure Requirements”	18
3. “Establishing the Scope of the Arbitration”	19
4. “The Basic Hearing”	20
5. “Third-Party Intervention”	22
6. “Awards and Judicial Scrutiny”	23
7. “Arbitral Costs”	23
8. “A Final Evaluation”	24
(iv) Arbitration and Lawyers	25
Section III. The Law of Arbitration: Basic Concepts	29
(i) Party Autonomy	29
(ii) Arbitration Agreements	30
(iii) Arbitrability	31
(iv) The Separability and <i>Kompetenz-Kompetenz</i>	35
(v) Amiable Composition	37
(vi) Duty to Arbitrate in Good Faith	39
(vii) Consolidation and Class Action in Arbitration	40

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	(viii) Selecting Arbitrators	43
	(ix) Adjudicatory Powers of the Arbitrators.....	45
	(x) Review and Enforcement of Awards	47
	(xi) The Contribution of Practice: Fast-Track Arbitration	49
	(xii) The “Modern” Arbitration Statute	50
Section IV.	A Critical Political Assessment.....	53
	(i) The Civil Rights Procedures Protection Act	53
	(ii) EEOC Notice	61
	(iii) U.S. Labor Department Position.....	73
Section V.	The Fountainhead Cases.....	81
	(i) The Ruling in <i>Gardner-Denver</i>	81
	(ii) The Ruling in <i>Gilmer</i>	92
Section VI.	The Employment Contract Exclusion (FAA §1)	107
	(i) Circuit City Stores, Inc. v. Adams	111
	(ii) The Aftermath of <i>Adams</i>	124
	(iii) The Law Before <i>Adams</i>	129
Section VII.	Fairness in the Employment Arbitration Contract.....	137
	(i) The Ruling in <i>Armendariz</i>	137
	(ii) Other Rulings.....	164
Section VIII.	The Allocation of Costs in Employment Arbitration Agreements.....	167
	(i) The Ruling in <i>Green Tree</i> and Other Cases.....	167
	(ii) The <i>Green Tree</i> Progeny	177
Section IX.	The Defense of Unconscionability	183
	(i) Tarulli v. Circuit City Stores, Inc.	186
	(ii) Martinez v. Master Protection Corp.	192
	(iii) Fitz v. NCR Corp.....	203

TABLE OF CONTENTS

(iv) Washington Mutual Fin. Grp.,
LLC v. Curry 220

(v) Hightower v. GMRI, Inc..... 226

**Section X. The Effect of an Employment Arbitration
Agreement on EEOC Jurisdiction 231**

(i) The Prior Cases..... 231

(ii) EEOC v. Waffle House, Inc..... 237

(iii) Subsequent Cases..... 251

**Section XI. Employment Arbitration Agreements
and Third-Party Beneficiaries..... 253**

(i) An Introduction to the Issue
and the Case..... 253

(ii) Penn v. Ryan’s Family Steak
Houses, Inc. 260

Section XII. The Basic Judicial Position 269

(i) The Standard Policy..... 271

*Metz v. Merrill Lynch, Pierce,
Fenner & Smith, Inc.* 271

(ii) The Standard Construction 273

*Great Western Mortgage
Corp. v. Peacock* 276

A Note on the Arbitrability of
Title VII Claims 286

(iii) Maintaining the Effectiveness
of Adjudication 287

Maye v. Smith Barney, Inc. 289

(iv) Distinguishing Between *Gilmer* and
Gardner-Denver 295

*Pryner v. Tractor Supply Co.
and Sobierajski v. Theosen Tractor
& Equipment Co.*..... 300

A Note on the Judicial Assessment
of the Opposing Doctrine 313

Nieves v. Individualized Shirts..... 313

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Section XIII. Minority Judicial Positions 321

(i) An Aggressive Interpretation
of *Gilmer* 321
*Austin v. Owens-Brockway Glass
Containers, Inc.* 323

(ii) Seeking Fairness in Employment
Arbitration Agreements 330
*Cole v. Burns International
Security Services* 337

(iii) The Arbitrability of Civil
Rights Claims 356
*Prudential Insurance Co.
of America v. Lai* 362
A Note on the Progeny 367
Willis v. Dean Witter Reynolds, Inc. 368

(iv) The Exception of Unconscionability 373
Stirlen v. Supercuts, Inc. 376

**Section XIV. Aspects of the Continuing Debate on the
Arbitrability of Title VII Claims** 389

(i) *Desiderio v. National Association
of Securities Dealers (NASD)*,
2 F. Supp. 2d 516 (S.D.N.Y. 1998) 390

(ii) The Decision in *Rosenberg v.
Merrill Lynch* 395

(iii) (a) *Hooters of America v. Phillips*,
39 F. Supp. 2d 582 (D.S.C. 1998) 399
(b) *Hooters* and the U.S. Fourth
Circuit Court of Appeals 400

(iv) *Seus v. John Nuveen & Co.*,
146 F.3d 175 (3d Cir. 1998),
cert. denied, 525 U.S. 1139 (1999) 403

(v) Title VII and the Award of Attorney's
Fees in Employment Arbitration 405

(vi) State Courts Uphold the Arbitrability
of Title VII Claims 411

(vii) The Seventh Circuit Adopts
Arbitrability 415

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Section XV.	The Settlements in the Smith Barney and Merrill Lynch Class Action Lawsuits	421
	(i) Smith Barney	421
	An Update	424
	(ii) Merrill Lynch	426
Section XVI.	The U.S. Supreme Court Decision in <i>Wright</i>	429
	(i) The Ruling in <i>Wright v. Universal Maritime Service Corp.</i>	430
	(ii) Subsequent Cases	433
Section XVII.	“Makeshift” Employment Arbitration Agreements	437
	(i) Employee Handbooks	438
	(ii) E-mail Agreements	450
	(iii) Agreements by Implication	453
	(iv) Agreements by Conduct	454
Section XVIII	The Institutional Position: Integrating the Legal Doctrine into Corporate Policy	457
	(i) The AAA’s Resolving Employment Disputes: A Practical Guide	460
	(ii) The AAA’s National Rules for The Resolution of Employment Disputes (Including Mediation and Arbitration Rules)	481
Section XIX.	A Model Agreement and Arbitral Process	521
	(i) Basic Considerations	521
	(ii) Provisions of a Model Agreement	526
	Index and Table of Cases	531

