

**ENFORCEMENT OF ARBITRAL
AWARDS
AGAINST SOVEREIGNS**

R. Doak Bishop
Editor



JurisNet, LLC

Questions About This Publication

For assistance with shipments, billing or other customer service matters, please call our Customer Services Department at:

1-631-350-2100

To obtain a copy of this book, call our Sales Department:

1-631-351-5430

Fax: 1-631-351-5712

Toll Free Order Line:

1-800-887-4064 (United States and Canada)

See our web page about this book:
<http://www.arbitrationlaw.com>

COPYRIGHT © 2009
by JurisNet, LLC

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced in any form or by any electronic or mechanical means including information storage and retrieval systems without permission in writing from the publisher.

Printed in the United States of America
ISBN: 978-1-933833-29-3

JurisNet, LLC
71 New Street
Huntington, New York 11743
USA
www.arbitrationlaw.com

**SUMMARY
TABLE OF CONTENTS**

TABLE OF CONTENTS vii
ABOUT THE EDITOR xix
CONTRIBUTING AUTHORS xxi

PART I

CHAPTER 1

**Introduction: The Enforcement of Arbitral
Awards against Sovereigns**

R. Doak Bishop3

CHAPTER 2

**Treaty Obligations to Honor Arbitral Awards
and Diplomatic Protection**

Lucy Reed and Lucy Martinez13

CHAPTER 3

Sovereign Immunity

Craig S. Miles35

CHAPTER 4

**Settlement of Investor-State Disputes through
Mediation – Preliminary Remarks on Processes,
Problems and Prospects**

Jack J. Coe, Jr.73

PART II

CHAPTER 5

**The Power of ICSID *Ad Hoc* Committees to Order
Security When Granting a Stay of Enforcement**

Margrete Stevens113

CHAPTER 6
The Enforcement of ICSID Arbitral Awards
Antonio R. Parra131

CHAPTER 7
Attachment and Execution on Commercial Assets
David W. Rivkin and Christopher K. Tahbaz139

CHAPTER 8
Attachment of Debts Owed to Sovereigns
Dana H. Freyer159

CHAPTER 9
Enforcement against Assets of State-owned Companies
Christopher F. Dugan and James E. Berger185

CHAPTER 10
Political Risk Insurance for Collection of Arbitral Awards
Frederick E. Jenney223

PART III

CHAPTER 11
The Enforcement of Arbitral Awards against Foreign Sovereigns – the United States
Edward G. Kehoe241

CHAPTER 12
Enforcement of Arbitral Awards against Sovereigns – Experience in the Courts of England and Wales
Judith Gill, Stephen Jagusch and Anthony Sinclair273

CHAPTER 13
Enforcement of Foreign Arbitral Awards against Sovereigns – Switzerland
Michael E. Schneider and Joachim Knoll311

CHAPTER 14**Enforcement of Arbitral Awards against
Sovereign States or State Entities – France**

Sarah François-Poncet, Brenda Horrigan and Lara Karam.....355

CHAPTER 15**Enforcement of Arbitral Awards against
Sovereigns – The Netherlands**

Pieter H.F. Bekker and Jacques F. de Heer.....381

CHAPTER 16**Enforcement of Foreign Awards against
Sovereigns in South America – the Cases of
Argentina and Ecuador**

Javier Robalino.....425

Table of Cases453

Index463

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABOUT THE EDITOR	xix
CONTRIBUTING AUTHORS	xxi

PART I

CHAPTER 1

Introduction: The Enforcement of Arbitral Awards against Sovereigns	3
<i>R. Doak Bishop</i>	

CHAPTER 2

Treaty Obligations to Honor Arbitral Awards and Diplomatic Protection	13
<i>Lucy Reed and Lucy Martinez</i>	

I. Treaty Obligations to Honor Arbitration Awards.....	14
A. New York Convention	14
B. ICSID Convention.....	15
C. NAFTA.....	16
D. Energy Charter Treaty.....	17
E. Bilateral Investment Treaties.....	17
1. General Undertaking.....	17
2. Intermediate Formulation	18
3. Special Dispute Resolution Mechanism	18
F. Treaty Obligations to Honor Awards as Waiver of State Immunity from Execution	20
II. Enforcing Treaty Obligations to Honor Awards	22
A. Options.....	22
B. Diplomatic Protection	25
C. The Role of the ICJ	28
D. The Practical Realities of Diplomatic Protection	32

CHAPTER 3

Sovereign Immunity	35
<i>Craig S. Miles</i>	
I. Introduction.....	35
II. Evolution from Absolute Immunity to Restrictive Immunity	36

III. The Distinction between Immunity from Jurisdiction and Immunity from Execution	42
A. Introduction.....	42
B. The U.S. Foreign Sovereign Immunities Act.....	43
1. Immunity from Jurisdiction	43
2. Immunity from Execution	48
3. Relevant Case Law	50
C. The United Kingdom (U.K.) State Immunity Act.....	62
D. Sovereign Immunity in France.....	65
E. Sovereign Immunity in Germany	69
IV. Conclusion	71

CHAPTER 4

Settlement of Investor-State Disputes through Mediation – Preliminary Remarks on Processes, Problems and Prospects	73
---	-----------

Jack J. Coe, Jr.

I. Introduction.....	73
II. Investor-State Disputes and Arbitration.....	75
III. ICSID Docket Patterns.....	77
A. ICSID's Remarkable Docket	77
B. Duration of Proceedings	79
C. Rates of Settlement	79
1. ICSID Cases	79
2. NAFTA Distinguished	80
IV. Terminology and Related Matters	81
A. Conciliation – Different from Mediation?	81
B. Mediators as Distinct from Arbitrators.....	82
V. The Parties	83
A. Claimants	83
B. Respondents	83
VI. The Role of Counsel.....	84
A. The Challenge of Managing Client Expectations	84
B. Counsel and the Mediation Process	85
VII. Mediation's Essential Nature and Strengths.....	85
VIII. Common Features of Governing Texts.....	87
A. Mandate and Guiding Principles	87
B. Independence of Neutrals	87
C. Obligations of the Parties.....	88
D. Number of Conciliators	88
E. Confidentiality	89

IX. Stages and Techniques	89
A. Creating an Optimistic Mood Conducive to Settlement	89
B. Opening Remarks and Presentations.....	90
C. Shuttle Diplomacy	90
D. Exploring the Weaknesses in Each Side’s Case	90
E. Identifying Lynchpins.....	91
X. Administering Institutions – Functions and Idiosyncrasies	91
A. In General	91
B. The ICSID Conciliation Regime – Distinctive Features	92
XI. Using Mediation for Investor-State Disputes.....	93
A. Obstacles and Criticisms.....	93
B. Expecting Too Much, Too Early – Beyond Steps and Cooling-off Periods.....	95
XII. Mediation as a Parallel Process with Multiple Points of Engagement.....	96
A. In General	96
B. The Cooling-off Period and Beyond	96
1. Basic Thesis.....	96
2. A Variation – Co-Mediation with a Sole Arbitrator	97
XIII. Making Full Use of the Shadow Mediator – Concurrent Mediator Tasks.....	97
A. In General	97
B. Claim Refinement, Issue Clarification and Engaging the Parties.....	98
C. Mediating Discovery and Other Procedural Disputes	98
D. Drafting Terms of Settlement.....	99
XIV. The Enforcement Question – Some Sample Techniques.....	100
A. Agreeing about Enforcement	100
B. Transforming Mediated Agreements into Globally Enforceable Awards	101
XV. Arbitrators as Instigators of Settlement	103
A. In General	103
B. Treaty Exhortations	104
C. Circulating Draft Awards.....	105
D. Treaty-based Traps for the Unwary	106
XVI. A Synthesis and Some Concluding Remarks.....	106

PART II

CHAPTER 5

The Power of ICSID *Ad Hoc* Committees to Order Security When Granting a Stay of Enforcement113

Margrete Stevens

- I. Introduction: Who’s at Risk? Safeguarding against Injustice and the Possible Abuse of the ICSID Annulment System113
- II. The Role of the *Ad Hoc* Committee and Its Authority to Order Security116
- III. The Question of Security – The Weighing of Circumstances.....120
- IV. A Closer Look at Argentina – Concern about Compliance126
- V. Conclusion: Balancing Prejudice and Abuse.....129

CHAPTER 6

The Enforcement of ICSID Arbitral Awards131

Antonio R. Parra

- I. Introduction.....131
- II. Enforcement Proceedings in National Courts – Four Cases.....132
- III. The Duty to “Abide and Comply”134
- IV. Voluntary Compliance and World Bank Influence.....136

CHAPTER 7

Attachment and Execution on Commercial Assets.....139

David W. Rivkin and Christopher K. Tahbaz

- I. National and International Law Framework Relevant to Attachment of and Execution against Sovereign Commercial Assets.....140
 - A. International Arbitration Conventions140
 - B. United States Law141
 - C. United Kingdom Law143
 - D. European Convention on State Immunity144
 - E. Other States.....145
- II. Is the Property “Commercial”?146
 - A. Commercial Property147
 - B. The Problem of Mixed Commercial/Sovereign Use.....152

C. Central Bank Funds	155
III. Commercial Activity in Recognition Proceedings	157
IV. Conclusion	158

CHAPTER 8

Attachment of Debts Owed to Sovereigns

Dana H. Freyer

I. General Considerations in Attaching Sovereign Assets	159
II. Attachment of Debts in Specific Jurisdictions	159
A. United States	159
1. Prerequisites for Attachment	159
2. Application to Specific Types of Debts	161
3. Procedures for Attachment	166
4. Summary	167
B. United Kingdom	167
1. Prerequisites for Attachment	167
2. Application to Specific Types of Debt	168
3. Procedures for Attachment	171
4. Summary	172
C. Switzerland	172
1. Prerequisites for Attachment	172
2. Case Law	175
3. Procedures for Attachment	175
4. Summary	177
D. France	178
1. Prerequisites for Attachment	178
2. Case Law	179
3. Procedures for Attachment	182
4. Summary	183
III. Conclusion	183

CHAPTER 9

Enforcement against Assets of State-owned Companies

Christopher F. Dugan and James E. Berger

I. Introduction	185
II. The FSIA – Background and Overview	186
III. The FSIA in Practice	188
A. Does the FSIA Apply?	188
B. Is the Foreign State Entitled to Immunity?	190
1. Waiver	191

- 2. Commercial Activities Expropriation
 - Exceptions.....191
- 3. Arbitration.....193
- C. Jurisdiction in Cases Arising under the FSIA195
- IV. Enforcement under the FSIA.....197
 - A. Attachment Jurisdiction under the FSIA198
 - 1. Execution against Foreign States199
 - 2. Execution against Foreign State Instrumentalities200
 - B. Property Subject to Attachment/Execution.....200
 - 1. “In the United States”201
 - 2. “Used for a Commercial Activity”204
 - 3. State Laws Governing Attachment and Execution207
 - C. Specific Types of Property Immune from Execution213
 - D. Prejudgment Attachment213
- V. Practical Issues under the FSIA.....214
 - A. Waiver214
 - B. Discovery215
 - C. Service of Process.....216
 - D. Default Judgments.....218
 - E. Alter Ego Theories of Enforcement220

CHAPTER 10

Political Risk Insurance for Collection of Arbitral Awards 223

Frederick E. Jenney

- I. Introduction.....223
- II. Collection Risk Following an Arbitral Award for Breach of Contract224
 - A. Breach of Contract Is a Key Investment Risk.....224
 - B. Contractual Remedy for Breach.....224
 - C. Dispute Resolution Procedures224
- III. Arbitral Award Default Coverage.....225
 - A. Overview of Arbitral Award Default Coverage.....225
 - B. Requirements for Arbitral Award Default Coverage226
 - 1. International Arbitration226
 - 2. Arbitral Award against Sovereign227
 - 3. Contract-based Monetary Award.....227
 - 4. Final and Binding Award228
 - C. Concerns about Host Government Interference.....228

IV. Denial of Justice Coverage.....	229
A. Overview of Denial of Justice Coverage.....	229
B. Requirements for Denial of Justice Coverage	231
V. Political Risk Insurance in General.....	232
A. Political Risk Insurance Market	232
B. Political Risk Insurance Theory	233
C. Breach of Contract Not Necessarily Political	233
D. Arbitral Award Default and Denial of Justice are Specialized Coverages	235
E. Dissatisfaction with Arbitration as Dispute Resolution Mechanism.....	235
VI. New Ideas for Arbitral Award Default Coverage	236
A. A New Idea: Coverage of Treaty-based Arbitration.....	236

PART III

CHAPTER 11

The Enforcement of Arbitral Awards against Foreign Sovereigns – the United States.....	241
<i>Edward G. Kehoe</i>	
I. Introduction.....	241
II. The U.S. Legal Order – Salient Aspects	242
A. The Federal Arbitration Act, New York Convention and the Panama Convention	244
B. Federal versus State Laws	244
C. Under U.S. Law, Default Judgment Can Be Entered against Foreign States.....	245
III. Substantive Grounds for Resisting Enforcement of Foreign Arbitral Awards	246
A. Grounds under the New York Convention.....	246
B. Judicially-created Ground: “Manifest Disregard of the Law”	248
IV. Recognition and Enforcement of ICSID Awards in the United States.....	248
A. 22 U.S.C. § 1650a	249
B. Procedure for Recognition and Enforcement of ICSID Awards in U.S. Courts	250
1. Registration	250
2. Complaint	250
3. Application for <i>Ex Parte</i> Order and Judgment	251

V. Sovereign Immunity and the Jurisdiction
of U.S. Courts.....252

A. The Foreign Sovereign Immunities Act (FSIA).....252

B. Overcoming Presumption of Sovereign
Immunity for U.S. Subject Matter Jurisdiction253

1. What Constitutes a “Foreign State”
under the FSIA253

2. “Arbitration” Exception: 28 U.S.C.
§1605(a)(6)(B).....255

3. “Waiver” Exception: 28 U.S.C.
§1605(a)(1).....256

4. “Commercial Activity” Exception:
28 U.S.C. §1605(a)(2).....257

C. Act of State Doctrine.....257

VI. Personal Jurisdiction and Due Process258

A. Service of Process.....258

B. Due Process Scrutiny under U.S. Constitutional
Law259

VII. Procedural Defenses to the Enforcement of Arbitral
Awards under U.S. Law.....260

A. *Forum Non Conveniens* – A New Weapon261

1. *Forum Non Conveniens* under U.S. Law.....261

2. An Additional Procedural Defense by
Sovereign States or Entities262

B. *Res Judicata* and Annulment of Awards by
Foreign National Courts264

VIII. Sovereign Immunity and Execution.....265

A. Reasonable Period of Time to Elapse before
Order of Execution265

B. Waiver of Sovereign Immunity from Execution266

C. Execution Generally Restricted to Property
of Sovereign Used for a Commercial Activity
in the United States.....266

D. Utilizing State Law Procedures on Attachment
of Property271

E. FSIA Does Not Provide for Monetary Sanctions
Should a Sovereign State or Entity Refuse to Obey
Writs of Execution or Attachment271

IX. Conclusion272

CHAPTER 12**Enforcement of Arbitral Awards against Sovereigns –****Experience in the Courts of England and Wales273***Judith Gill, Stephen Jagusch and Anthony Sinclair*

I.	Introduction.....	273
II.	The General Framework for Enforcement.....	274
	A. Arbitration Act 1996	274
	B. Common Law	277
	C. Other Methods of Enforcement	278
III.	Anticipatory Measures.....	279
	A. Security for the Award.....	279
	B. Interim Injunctions	282
	C. Freezing Injunctions.....	284
	D. Security for Costs.....	285
IV.	Key Remedies Available on the Enforcement of an Award	286
	A. Charging Orders	286
	B. Third Party Debt/Garnishee Orders.....	287
	C. Writ of <i>Fieri Facias</i>	288
	D. Equitable Execution.....	288
	E. Winding Up Proceedings	289
V.	Cross-Enforcement against States and State Entities?	289
VI.	Resisting Enforcement under the Arbitration Act.....	293
VII.	State Immunity Act 1978.....	296
	A. Introduction.....	296
	B. Immunity from Adjudicative Jurisdiction.....	296
	1. Waiver of Immunity	297
	2. Commercial Transactions	298
	3. Agreement to Arbitrate Exception	300
	C. Procedural Advantages Conferred by the State Immunity Act	301
	D. Immunity from Enforcement Jurisdiction.....	303
	1. Waiver	304
	2. Property Used for Commercial Purposes.....	304
	E. Organs, Agencies and Other State Entities	305
	1. “Separate Entities”	306
	2. Central Banks	306
VIII.	Conclusion.....	308

CHAPTER 13

Enforcement of Foreign Arbitral Awards against Sovereigns – Switzerland	311
<i>Michael E. Schneider and Joachim Knoll</i>	
I. Introduction.....	311
II. Enforcement Proceedings under Swiss Law	312
III. Enforcement of Arbitral Awards	316
IV. Enforcement against Foreign States	318
V. Immunity of Foreign States – Obligations under Public International Law.....	324
A. Restricted Immunity as Developed by the Federal Tribunal.....	324
B. The Distinction between Sovereign and Commercial Acts.....	327
C. The Use of a Single Concept for Immunity of Jurisdiction and of Execution	329
D. Waiver of Immunity	331
E. Immunity and Arbitration.....	332
F. Relevant Treaties.....	335
VI. Domestic Rules on Sovereign Immunity – The Requirement of a Swiss Connection (“ <i>Binnenbeziehung</i> ”).....	338
VII. Assets Immune from Measures of Enforcement	345
VIII. Personal Identity – Who Benefits from Sovereign Immunity and How Are the Assets of the State Defined?	348
A. The Beneficiary of Immunity	349
B. The Link between the Award Debtor and the Assets Seized.....	350
IX. Conclusion	353

CHAPTER 14

Enforcement of Arbitral Awards against Sovereign States or State Entities – France	355
<i>Sarah François-Poncet, Brenda Horrigan and Lara Karam</i>	
I. Introduction.....	355
II. Procedural Steps	355
A. Preliminary Step: Obtaining <i>Exequatur</i> of an Arbitral Award.....	355
B. Enforcement Measures.....	357
III. Immunity from Execution	358
A. Applicable Rules for Immunity from Execution	359
1. States.....	359

2. State Entities/Instrumentalities.....	362
3. Foreign Central Banks.....	363
4. International Organizations	365
5. Diplomatic Missions.....	366
B. Waiver of Immunity from Execution.....	369
IV. Determination of the Assets and the Entity Against Which Enforcement May be Sought.....	372
A. “Nexus” Requirement between an Asset and the Underlying Claim upon Which the Arbitral Award Is Based	373
B. Enforcing against the Assets of an Entity Different from the One against Which the Award Was Rendered	374
1. French Courts’ Definition of “Emanation”	374
2. Consequences for Emanations.....	376
C. Potential Liability Resulting from an Improper Attempt to Enforce against a Sovereign’s Assets	377
V. Conclusion	379

CHAPTER 15

Enforcement of Arbitral Awards against Sovereigns –

The Netherlands	381
<i>Pieter H.F. Bekker and Jacques F. de Heer</i>	
I. Introduction.....	381
II. The Law.....	383
A. Treaties Binding The Netherlands.....	383
1. Principal Treaties	383
2. Other Treaties.....	384
B. Dutch Domestic Law	386
1. Introduction.....	386
2. Procedure for the Enforcement of Foreign Arbitral Awards	388
i. Enforcement pursuant to a treaty: Article 1075 CCP	388
ii. Enforcement outside the treaty context: Art. 1076 CCP.....	389
III. Dutch Court Decisions	391
A. Introduction.....	391
B. Summary of Leading Decisions.....	392
1. The SEEE/Yugoslavia Cases.....	392
2. The SPP/Egypt Case.....	395
3. Immunity Issues	396

IV. Measures of Constraint Targeting Foreign Sovereign Property399

 A. Introduction.....399

 B. Treaty Law400

 C. Dutch Domestic Law401

 1. Basic Procedure for Attachments401

 2. Attachment of Sovereign Property – Immunity Issues405

 i. Introduction405

 ii. Dutch domestic law.....407

 iii. International law413

 iv. The role of the Dutch executive branch in attachment matters418

 3. States or State Entities?420

V. Conclusion423

CHAPTER 16

Enforcement of Foreign Awards against Sovereigns in South America – the Cases of Argentina and Ecuador425
Javier Robalino

I. Introduction.....425

II. Republic of Argentina428

 A. Introduction.....428

 B. The Applicable International Law on Enforcement of Awards428

 C. Applicable Local Provisions on Enforcement of Awards431

 D. Specific Provisions on Attachments434

 E. Recent Argentine Case Law435

 F. What May Be Expected of Argentina?439

III. Republic of Ecuador441

 A. Introductory Comments441

 B. Local Provisions on Enforcement of Awards443

 C. International Provisions for Enforcement of Awards447

 D. The EMELEC Case.....448

 E. What May Be Expected of Ecuador?450

Table of Cases453

Index463