

The Enforcement of Foreign Arbitral Awards in Russia

Eleven Years of Commercial Court Practice
Applying the New York Convention

William R. Spiegelberger

JURIS

Questions About This Publication

For assistance with shipments, billing or other customer service matters, please call our Customer Services Department at:

1-631-350-2100

To obtain a copy of this book, call our Sales Department:

1-631-351-5430

Fax: 1-631-351-5712

Toll Free Order Line:

1-800-887-4064 (United States & Canada)

See our web page about this book:
www.arbitrationlaw.com

COPYRIGHT © 2014
JurisNet, LLC

All Rights Reserved.
Printed in the United States of America.
ISBN 978-1- 937518-45-5

JurisNet, LLC
71 New Street
Huntington, New York 11743
USA
www.arbitrationlaw.com

SUMMARY TABLE OF CONTENTS

Preface	xiii
Abbreviations	xv
Note on Translation.....	xix
Introduction.....	xxi
I. Overview of the Enforcing Court System.....	1
II. Laws and Treaties Applicable to Enforcement	7
III. NY Convention Article V(1)(a): Party Incapacity or Invalid Agreement to Arbitrate	23
IV. NY Convention Article V(1)(b): Improper Notice or Inability to Present Case.....	37
V. NY Convention Article V(1)(c): The Award Deals with a Difference not Contemplated by the Submission to Arbitration or Contains Decisions on Matters Beyond the Scope of the Submission	61
VI. NY Convention Article V(1)(d): The Composition of Tribunal or the Procedure Was Not in Accordance with Party Agreement or with the Law of the Place of Arbitration.....	69
VII. NY Convention Article V(1)(e): The Award Is Not Binding or Has Been Set Aside or Suspended.....	73
VIII. NY Convention Article V(2)(a): The Subject Matter of the Difference is Not Capable of Settlement by Arbitration under the law of the Russian Federation.....	79
IX. NY Convention Article V(2)(b): Violation of the Public Policy of the Russian Federation.....	85

THE ENFORCEMENT OF FOREIGN ARBITRAL AWARDS IN RUSSIA

Afterword	125
Appendices	
A. Convention on the Recognition and Enforcement of Foreign Arbitral Awards (New York, 1958)	129
B. European Convention on International Commercial Arbitration (Geneva, 1961)	137
C. Treaty on the Manner of Resolving Disputes in the Area of Commercial Activity (Kiev, 1992).....	147
D. Section III (Articles 51-55) of the Convention on Legal Assistance and Legal Relations in Civil, Family, and Criminal Matters (Minsk, 1993).....	155
E. Convention on the Resolution by Arbitration of Civil Law Disputes in the Area of Economic and Scientific-Technical Cooperation (Moscow, 1972)....	159
F. Law of the Russian Federation on International Commercial Arbitration No. 5338-I (1993)	165
G. Chapters 30-33 of the Code of Procedure of the Commercial Court of the Russian Federation (2002) ...	185
H. Informational Letter of the Presidium of the Supreme Commercial Court of the Russian Federation No. 96 (2005)	211
I. Informational Letter of the Presidium of the Supreme Commercial Court of the Russian Federation No. 156 (2013)	263
J. Table of Commercial Court Cases Granting or Denying Enforcement of Foreign Arbitral Awards 2003-2013	285
K. Tables of Enforcement Rates by Year, Type of Award, and Defense(s) to Enforcement Pleaded.....	307
Index	311

DETAILED TABLE OF CONTENTS

Preface	xiii
Abbreviations	xv
Note on Translation.....	xix
Introduction.....	xxi
I. Overview of the Enforcing Court System	1
A. The Commercial Court Branch	1
B. The Commercial Courts of Subjects of the Russian Federation	2
C. The Appellate Commercial Courts	4
D. The Commercial Courts of the Circuits.....	4
E. The Supreme Court of the Russian Federation.....	5
II. Laws and Treaties Applicable to Enforcement	7
A. The Code of Procedure of the Commercial Court.....	7
B. The ICA Law and NY Convention.....	12
C. The NY Convention: Russian Peculiarities	15
D. The European Convention.....	17
E. The Kiev Treaty.....	18
F. The Minsk Convention.....	19
G. The Moscow Convention	19
H. An Exemplary Case.....	20

THE ENFORCEMENT OF FOREIGN ARBITRAL AWARDS IN RUSSIA

III. NY Convention Article V(1)(a): Party Incapacity or Invalid Agreement to Arbitrate	23
A. Forged Signature	23
B. Signature Authority	25
C. Faulty Arbitration Clause	25
D. Amendment to Arbitration Clause.....	28
E. Assignment of Right to Arbitrate	29
F. Contract Brokered by Email.....	32
G. Expired Contract.....	34
H. Branch Office Lacking Capacity	34
IV. NY Convention Article V(1)(b): Improper Notice or Inability to Present Case	37
A. Mutual Legal Assistance Treaties	38
B. The Hague Service Convention.....	41
C. The Kiev Treaty.....	44
D. CPCC Articles 244(1)(2) and 242(3)(3).....	46
E. Partial Notice.....	48
F. Authority to Accept Notice	52
G. Burden of Proof.....	55
H. Email Notice.....	58
I. Inability to Attend Hearing.....	58

DETAILED TABLE OF CONTENTS

V. NY Convention Article V(1)(c): The Award Deals with a Difference not Contemplated by the Submission to Arbitration or Contains Decisions on Matters Beyond the Scope of the Submission	61
A. Scope of Damages	62
B. Appendix to Contract	64
C. Related Contracts	66
VI. NY Convention Article V(1)(d): The Composition of Tribunal or the Procedure Was Not in Accordance with Party Agreement or with the Law of the Place of Arbitration	69
A. Appointing Authority	69
B. Objection to Procedure	71
C. Acquiescence in Deviation	72
VII. NY Convention Article V(1)(e): The Award Is Not Binding or Has Been Set Aside or Suspended	73
A. ICC Rule (1998) 28(6)	74
B. Belarusian Law	75
C. Burden of Proof	76
D. Cost Award	76
E. Conservatory Measures	77
F. Partial Setting Aside	78
VIII. NY Convention Article V(2)(a): The Subject Matter of the Difference is Not Capable of Settlement by Arbitration under the law of the Russian Federation	79
A. Legal Framework: Non-Arbitral Matters	79
B. Russian Law of Mandatory Application	81

THE ENFORCEMENT OF FOREIGN ARBITRAL AWARDS IN RUSSIA

IX. NY Convention Article V(2)(b): Violation of the Public Policy of the Russian Federation	85
A. Legislative Pronouncements.....	85
B. Informational Letter No. 156.....	87
C. Prior Russian Judgment Invalidating Contract: The “Russian Defense”.....	90
D. Symmetric Optional Dispute Resolution Clause	98
E. Asymmetric Optional Dispute Resolution Clause.....	99
F. No Liability without Fault.....	102
G. Joint Marital Property.....	104
H. Bankrupt Debtor Party.....	106
I. Typographical Error in Award	109
J. Bad Faith and Unconscionable Conduct	110
K. Damages in Non-Russian Currency	112
L. Forged Contract.....	112
M. Liquidated Damages and Interest	113
Afterword	125
Appendices	
A. Convention on the Recognition and Enforcement of Foreign Arbitral Awards (New York, 1958).....	129
B. European Convention on International Commercial Arbitration (Geneva, 1961)	137
C. Treaty on the Manner of Resolving Disputes in the Area of Commercial Activity (Kiev, 1992).....	147
D. Section III (Articles 51-55) of the Convention on Legal Assistance and Legal Relations in Civil, Family, and Criminal Matters (Minsk, 1993).....	155

DETAILED TABLE OF CONTENTS

E. Convention on the Resolution by Arbitration of Civil Law Disputes in the Area of Economic and Scientific-Technical Cooperation (Moscow, 1972)....	159
F. Law of the Russian Federation on International Commercial Arbitration No. 5338-I (1993)	165
G. Chapters 30-33 of the Code of Procedure of the Commercial Court of the Russian Federation (2002) ..	185
H. Informational Letter of the Presidium of the Supreme Commercial Court of the Russian Federation No. 96 (2005)	211
I. Informational Letter of the Presidium of the Supreme Commercial Court of the Russian Federation No. 156 (2013)	263
J. Table of Commercial Court Cases Granting or Denying Enforcement of Foreign Arbitral Awards 2003-2013.....	285
K. Tables of Enforcement Rates by Year, Type of Award, and Defense(s) to Enforcement Pleaded	307
Index	311

