

**International Arbitration Institute  
Institut pour l'Arbitrage International**

**Fifteen Years of  
NAFTA Chapter 11  
Arbitration**

---

**Joint McGill University / IAI Conference  
Montreal – 25 September 2009**

**General Editor: Emmanuel Gaillard**

**Edited by Frédéric Bachand**

**JURIS**

### **Questions About This Publication**

For assistance with shipments, billing or other customer service matters, please call our Customer Services Department at: +1-631-350-0200.

To obtain a copy of this book in the United States and Canada  
Call our Toll Free Order Line: +1-800-887-4064 or Fax: +1-631-351-5712

To obtain a copy of this book in Switzerland, Germany and Austria  
Call +41 031 300 66 66

This book may be cited as:

FIFTEEN YEARS OF NAFTA CHAPTER 11 ARBITRATION,  
IAI SERIES NO. 7  
(F. Bachand ed., 2011)

For any inquiry regarding these materials or the IAI, an organization created under the auspices of the Comité Français de l'Arbitrage (CFA), you may contact Nanou Leleu-Knobil ([nleleuknobil@shearman.com](mailto:nleleuknobil@shearman.com)).

COPYRIGHT © 2011

by

JurisNet, LLC

and

International Arbitration Institute (IAI)

---

All Rights Reserved

Printed in the United States of America

ISBN 978-1-933833-76-7

JurisNet, LLC.

71 New Street

Huntington, New York 11743

USA

[www.jurispub.com](http://www.jurispub.com)

---

# FIFTEEN YEARS OF NAFTA CHAPTER 11 ARBITRATION

---

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>INTRODUCTION .....</b>	<i>Frédéric Bachand</i>	1
<b>PART I</b>		
<b>THE BROADER CONTEXT .....</b>		3
Is NAFTA Arbitration “International” .....	<i>Thomas E. Carboneau</i>	5
NAFTA at Fifteen—A View from ICSID .....	<i>Meg Kinnear</i>	21
<b>PART II</b>		
<b>PROCEDURAL ISSUES.....</b>		35
Local Remedies under NAFTA Chapter 11 .....	<i>William S. Dodge</i>	37
Lessons of Chapter 11: Procedural Integrity and Systemic Integrity.....	<i>Armand de Mestral</i>	57
Judicial Review of NAFTA Chapter 11 Arbitral Awards .....	<i>Henri C. Alvarez</i>	103
<b>PART III</b>		
<b>SUBSTANTIVE ISSUES.....</b>		173
Interpretive Powers of the Free Trade Commission and the Rule of Law.....	<i>Gabrielle Kaufmann-Kohler</i>	175

## Table of Contents

NAFTA Chapter 11 and the Environment: An Assessment after Fifteen Years .....	<i>Andrea K. Bjorklund</i>	195
The Future of NAFTA Chapter 11: The Next Fifteen Years.....	<i>Luis González García</i>	219
<b>PART IV</b>		
<b>THE STATES' PERSPECTIVES .....</b>		243
NAFTA Chapter 11 at Fifteen: A Few Key Questions Resolved .....	<i>Mark Feldman</i>	245
<i>ANNEXES</i> .....		257
<b>ANNEX 1</b>		
Relevant Provisions of the North American Free Trade Agreement.....		259
<b>ANNEX 2</b>		
Notes of Interpretation of Certain Chapter 11 Provisions (NAFTA Free Trade Commission, July 31, 2001) .....		293
<b>ANNEX 3</b>		
Statement of the Free Trade Commission on Non-Disputing Party Participation (October 7, 2003) .....		297
<b>ANNEX 4</b>		
List of Participants to the Joint McGill-IAI Conference Held in Montreal on September 25, 2009 .....		301
<b>ANNEX 5</b>		
Table of Abbreviations .....		307