INVESTMENT TREATY
ARBITRATION AND
INTERNATIONAL LAW

Ian A. Laird
Borzu Sabahi
Frédéric G. Sourgens
Todd J. Weiler
Editors

Kabir Duggal
Associate Editor

Volume 8

JURIS
Questions About This Publication

For assistance with shipments, billing or other customer service matters, please call our Customer Services Department at:

1-631-350-2100

To obtain a copy of this book, call our Sales Department:

1-631-351-5430
Fax: 1-631-673-9117

Toll Free Order Line:

1-800-887-4064 (United States & Canada)

See our web page about this book:
www.arbitrationlaw.com

COPYRIGHT © 2015
by JurisNet, LLC

All Rights Reserved.

Printed in the United States of America
ISBN: 978-1-937518-69-1

JurisNet, LLC
71 New Street
Huntington, New York 11743
USA

www.arbitrationlaw.com
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

## Introduction

*Fundamentals Revisited*

Frédéric G. Sourges ................................................................. vii

## Profiles................................................................................. xiii

### PART I

**CHALLENGES TO ARBITRATORS: SHOULD THE CHALLENGE PROCESS BE OVERHAULED?**

**CHAPTER 1**

To Use a Cannon to Kill a Mosquito: Why the Increase in Arbitrator Challenges in Investment Arbitration Does Not Warrant a Complete Overhaul of the System

Charles B. Rosenberg ................................................................. 3

**CHAPTER 2**

Arbitrator Challenges in Investment Arbitration: Is an Overhaul Needed?

Fernando A. Tupa......................................................................... 29

**CHAPTER 3**

Challenges to Arbitrators: Should the Challenge Process Be Overhauled?

Ms. Julie Bédard  
Professor George K. Foster  
Ms. Kate Brown de Vejar  
Professor Alexander Bělohlávek  
Ms. Amal Bouchenaki

PANEL DISCUSSION ........................................................................... 67

### PART II

**NEW DEVELOPMENTS IN DEFINITION OF “INVESTMENT”: WHAT IS THE ROLE OF THE CONCEPT OF “PROPERTY” IN INVESTMENT ARBITRATION?**

**CHAPTER 4**

The Full Measure of Full Protection and Security

Margarita R. Sánchez and Robert A. DeRise ........................................... 99
CHAPTER 5
Back to Bricks and Mortar: The Case for a “Traditional” Definition of Investment that Never Was

Timothy L. Foden .......................................................... 125

CHAPTER 6
New Developments in Definition of “Investment”: What Is the Role of the Concept of “Property” in Investment Arbitration?

Ms. Tina Cicchetti
Ms. Eloïse Obadia
Mr. Paolo Di Rosa
Mr. Charles Roh
Mr. Jonathan Kallmer

PANEL DISCUSSION ...................................................... 167

CHAPTER 7
Keynote Speaker Transcript

George Kahale III ........................................................ 191

PART III
IS INVESTMENT TREATY ARBITRATION A MECHANISM TO SECOND-GUESS GOVERNMENTS’ EXERCISE OF ADMINISTRATIVE DISCRETION: PUBLIC LAW OR LEX INVESTORIA?

CHAPTER 8
Is Investment Treaty Arbitration a Mechanism to Second-guess Governments’ Exercise of Administrative Discretion: Public Law or Lex Investoria?

James Egerton-Vernon .............................................. 201

CHAPTER 9
Investor-State Arbitration as International Public Law: Deference, Proportionality and the Standard of Review

Paul Barker ............................................................... 235
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

**CHAPTER 10**  
Is Investment Treaty Arbitration a Mechanism to Second-guess Governments’ Exercise of Administrative Discretion: Public Law or *Lex Investoria*?  

*Professor Joshua Karton*  
*Ms. Caline Mouawad*  
*Mr. Matthew Kronby*  
*Professor Julián Cárdenas García*  
*Ms. Janet Whittaker*

**PANEL DISCUSSION** ................................................................. 271

**PART IV**  
AWARDING DAMAGES: PROPORTIONALITY, CONTRIBUTORY FAULT, AND ARBITRAL TRIBUNALS’ DISCRETION OR TOSS OF A COIN?

**CHAPTER 11**  
Proportionality, Contributory Negligence and Other Equity Considerations in Investment Arbitration  

*Juan Felipe Merizalde Urdaneta* .......................................................... 301

**CHAPTER 12**  
The Arbitral Tribunal’s Discretion in Quantifying Damages  

*Meriam N. Alrashid* ........................................................................... 327

**CHAPTER 13**  
Awarding Damages: Proportionality, Contributory Fault, and Arbitral Tribunals’ Discretion or Toss of a Coin?  

*Mr. Craig Miles*  
*Mr. Mark Bravin*  
*Mr. Matthew Kronby*  
*Mr. Pablo D. López Zadicoff*  
*Mr. Sirshar Qureshi*

**PANEL DISCUSSION** .................................................................. 355

**TABLE OF CASES** ...................................................................... 383

**INDEX** ...................................................................................... 389