THE AMERICAN REVIEW
OF
INTERNATIONAL ARBITRATION

Vol. XIII – 2002

This volume comprises the series of papers on International Arbitration that were presented at a Research Conference on International and Domestic Arbitration, sponsored by the Institute of Judicial Administration. The Conference was held at the New York University School of Law. This collection constitutes Volume XIII of The American Review of International Arbitration in its entirety.

Center for
International Arbitration
And Litigation Law

Columbia University

New York

2002
The American Review of International Arbitration is a publication of the Center for International Arbitration and Litigation Law which is devoted to the study of laws relating to international arbitration and litigation throughout the world. To that end, it promotes and sponsors the publication of books, commentaries, articles, periodicals and conferences on these subjects. The American Review of International Arbitration is one of the Center’s publications. Other publications sponsored by the Center are the eight volume Guides to International Arbitration and the World Arbitration Reporter. The Center also co-operates with institutions engaged in advocating and administering international arbitration and sponsors clerkships at those institutions.

The Director of the Center is Hans Smit, Stanley H. Fuld Professor of Law, Columbia University. Inquiries about the Center and its activities should be addressed to:

Hans Smit
Stanley H. Fuld Professor of Law
Columbia Law School
435 West 116th Street
New York, New York 10027
Tel: (212) 854-2693; Fax (212) 222-4256
E-mail: hsmit@law.columbia.edu

ISSN 1050-4109
Copyright © 2003 by Hans Smit and Juris Publishing, Inc.
THE AMERICAN REVIEW
OF
INTERNATIONAL ARBITRATION

EDITORS-IN-CHIEF

HANS SMIT
VRATISLAV PECHOTA

MANAGING EDITOR

ELIZABETH H. COOPER

SENIOR STUDENT EDITORS

HOWARD BAKER, YONA CONZEVOY, MINDY FOSS, KATHRINE GEHRING,
ADRIA PEREZ, MARRI TUSSING

STUDENT EDITORS

LESLIE BENNETT, EDUARDO CORRETJER, JOSE DIAZ, JONATHAN FARKAS,
SARAH FRIEDMAN, YUICHI HARAGUCHI, ABID IMAM, RACHEL JACOBS,
CHEOMA JULIEN, JOANNA MCRAE, GEOFFREY MORRIS, STUART ORSAK,
CHAD SILVERMAN, ANDREAS STIER, YI ZHANG

BOARD OF ADVISORS

GIORGIO BERNINI
HORACIO A. GRIGERA NAÓN
BERNARD HANOTIAU
MICHAEL F. HOELLERING
J. MARTIN H. HUNTER
NEIL KAPLAN
SERGEI N. LEBEDEV
PIERRE MAYER
WERNER MELIS
ALLAN PHILIP
MICHAEL CHARLES PRYLE
CLAUDIA REYMOND
OTTO SANDROCK
TOSHI SAWADA
VINCENZO VIGORITI

President, International Council for Commercial Arbitration
Special Counsel, White & Case, Washington, D.C.
Professor, Universities of Louvain and Namur
General Counsel, American Arbitration Association
Barrister, London and Professor, Nottingham Law School
Special Counsel, Debevoise & Plimpton
President, Maritime Arbitration Commission, Moscow
Professor, Université de Paris I — Sorbonne, Paris
Chairman, Arbitral Centre of the Federal Economic Chamber, Vienna
Philip & Partners, Copenhagen
Arbitrator; Consultant to Clayton, Utz.
Professor, University of Geneva
Professor Emeritus, University of Muenster;
Partner, Hoelters & Elsing
Professor, Sophia University, Tokyo
Professor, University of Florence
# THE AMERICAN REVIEW OF INTERNATIONAL ARBITRATION

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Vol. 13</th>
<th>2002</th>
<th>Nos. 1-4</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>INTRODUCTION</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>vii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>REPORTS</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INTERNATIONAL ARBITRATION: SCAPEGOAT OR SOLUTION</td>
<td>Andreas F. Lowenfeld</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INTERNATIONAL ARBITRATION: COMMENTS FROM A CRITIC</td>
<td>Linda Silberman</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SEPARABILITY AND COMPETENCE – COMPETENCE IN INTERNATIONAL ARBITRATION: <em>EX NIHILO NIHL FIT? OR CAN SOMETHING INDEED COME FROM NOTHING?</em></td>
<td>Robert H. Smit</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IN THE SHADOW OF THE UNRULY HORSE: INTERNATIONAL ARBITRATION AND THE PUBLIC POLICY EXCEPTION</td>
<td>Homayoon Arfazadeh</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COMMENTS ON PUBLIC POLICY IN INTERNATIONAL ARBITRATION</td>
<td>Hans Smit</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MASS CLAIMS PROCESSES</td>
<td>Howard M. Holtzmann</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AMENDING THE FEDERAL ARBITRATION ACT:</td>
<td>William W. Park</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COMMENT ON A PROPOSED NEW STATUTE FOR INTERNATIONAL ARBITRATION</td>
<td>Richard W. Hulbert</td>
<td>153</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>REMARKS ON AMENDING THE FAA</td>
<td>Kenneth Davis</td>
<td>167</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
THE RULE OF LAWYERS AND THE ETHOS OF DIPLOMATS: REFLECTIONS ON THE INTERNAL AND EXTERNAL LEGITIMACY OF WTO DISPUTE SETTLEMENT

J.H.H. Weiler 177

THE WTO’S LEGITIMACY CRISIS: REFLECTIONS ON THE LAW AND POLITICS OF WTO DISPUTE RESOLUTION

Jeffrey L. Dunoff 197