Annulment
of
ICSID Awards

A Joint IAI–ASIL Conference
Washington, D.C. – April 1, 2003

General Editor: Emmanuel Gaillard
Edited by Emmanuel Gaillard and Yas Banifatemi
Questions About This Publication

For assistance with shipments, billing or other customer service matters, please call our Customer Services Department at: 1-631-350-2100.

To obtain a copy of this book, call our Sales Department:
1-631-351-5430
Fax: 1-631-351-5712

Toll Free Order Line:
1-800-887-4064 (United States & Canada)
See our web page about this book:
www.jurispub.com

This book may be cited as:

IAI INTERNATIONAL ARBITRATION SERIES No. 1,
ANNULMENT OF ICSID AWARDS (E. Gaillard and Y. Banifatemi eds. 2004)

For any inquiry regarding these materials or regarding the IAI, an organization created under the auspices of the Comité Français de l’Arbitrage (CFA), you may contact Nanou Leleu-Knobil (nleleuknobil@shearman.com).

COPYRIGHT © 2004
by
JurisNet, LLC
and
International Arbitration Institute

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced in any form or by any electronic or mechanical means including information storage and retrieval systems without permission in writing from the publisher.

All Rights Reserved
Printed in the United States of America
ISBN 1-929446-61-6
Juris Publishing, Inc.
71 New Street
Huntington, New York 11743
USA
www.jurispub.com
# ANNULMENT OF ICSID AWARDS

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

**FOREWORD** .......................................................... *Charles N. Brower* 1

**INTRODUCTION** .................................................. *Emmanuel Gaillard* 5

**PART I**
**GENERAL FEATURES OF ICSID ANNULMENT PROCEEDINGS** ...... 9

Article 52 of the Washington Convention – A Brief Introduction................................................... *Hans Van Houtte* 11

Three Generations of ICSID Annulment Proceedings........................................................... *Christoph Schreuer* 17

Finality at What Cost? The Decision of the *Ad Hoc* Committee in *Wena Hotels v. Egypt*............. *Eric A. Schwartz* 43


The *Vivendi* Annulment Decision and the Lessons for Future ICSID Arbitrations – The Applicants’ Perspective ..................................................................... *Stanimir A. Alexandrov* 97

*Vivendi v. Argentina*: on the Admissibility of Requests for Partial Annulment and the Ground of a Manifest Excess of Powers .......................... *Carlos Ignacio Suarez Anzorena* 123

Stay of Enforcement of the Arbitral Award Pending ICSID Annulment Proceedings....................... *Paul D. Friedland* 177
Table of Contents

**PART II**

**THE REVIEW OF ICSID ARBITRAL AWARDS** ............................. 187


The Extent of Review of the Applicable Law in Investment Treaty Arbitration ........................... *Emmanuel Gaillard* 223

To What Extent Can an *Ad Hoc* Committee Review the Factual Findings of an Arbitral Tribunal ............ *Pierre Mayer* 243

To What Extent May an *Ad Hoc* Committee Review the Factual Findings of an Arbitral Tribunal Based on a Procedural Error?  .................................................. *Peter D. Trooboff* 251

Setting Aside Additional Facility Awards: the *Metalclad* Case ............................................................. *Henri C. Alvarez* 267

The Introduction of an Appellate Mechanism: the U.S. Trade Act of 2002 ............................................................. *Barton Legum* 289

Concluding Remarks ............................................................ *Pierre Lalive* 297

**ANNEXES**

**ANNEX 1**

*Wena Hotels Limited v. Arab Republic of Egypt*, Award of December 8, 2000  317

**ANNEX 2**


**ANNEX 3**

*Compañía de Aguas del Aconquija S.A. and Compagnie Générale des Eaux v. Argentine Republic*, Award of November 21, 2000  403
ANNEX 4
Compañía de Aguas del Aconquija S.A. and Vivendi Universal (formerly Compagnie Générale des Eaux) v. Argentine Republic, Decision of the Ad Hoc Committee, July 3, 2002

ANNEX 5
List of Participants to the IAI-ASIL Conference Held in Washington, D.C. on April 1, 2003