

ENERGY DISPUTE RESOLUTION:
INVESTMENT PROTECTION, TRANSIT
AND THE
ENERGY CHARTER TREATY

Edited by
Graham Coop
with the assistance of
Philippe Gurd Gross



ARBITRATION INSTITUTE
OF THE STOCKHOLM CHAMBER OF COMMERCE



**British Institute of
International and
Comparative Law**



International Chamber of Commerce
The world business organization



ICSID
INTERNATIONAL CENTRE FOR
SETTLEMENT OF INVESTMENT DISPUTES

JURIS

Questions About This Publication

For assistance with shipments, billing or other customer service matters,
please call our Customer Services Department at:

1-631-350-2100

To obtain a copy of this book, call our Sales Department:

1-631-351-5430

Fax: 1-631-351-5712

Toll Free Order Line:

1-800-887-4064 (United States & Canada)

See our web page about this book:

www.jurispub.com

COPYRIGHT © 2011
by JurisNet, LLC

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced in any form
or by any electronic or mechanical means including information storage and
retrieval systems without permission in writing from the publisher.

All Rights Reserved.
Printed in the United States of America.

ISBN 978-1-933833-79-8

JurisNet, LLC
71 New Street
Huntington, New York 11743
USA
www.jurispub.com

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Editor's Preface.....	xiii
About the Editor.....	xix
List of Contributors.....	xxiii
List of Institutions	xliii
Introductory Remarks and Opening Comments	xlvi
<i>André Mernier</i>	xlvi
<i>Ulf Franke</i>	xlix
<i>Jason A. Fry</i>	liii
<i>Meg Kinnear</i>	lvii
<i>Christiaan M.J. Kröner</i>	lxi
<i>Norah Gallagher</i>	lxvii
Part I: What's New? Awards, Decisions and Other Developments in Recent Energy Charter Treaty Investment Arbitrations.....	1
Chapter 1 - When does a violation of the domestic law of the host state amount to a violation of a public international law principle in determining protection of investors' claims? <i>Virginie Colaiuta</i>	3
I Where the treaty refers to the law of the host State in defining protected investments	4
II Where the treaty does not contain a legality requirement in defining investments	12
III Reciprocal application of the international public law principle of good faith in investor-State dealings	15
IV Conclusion.....	22

Chapter 2 - Investment arbitration under the Energy Charter Treaty: the novel case of <i>Plama Consortium Limited v. Republic of Bulgaria</i> <i>Jonathan C. Hamilton, Petr Polášek and Sylvia T. Tonova</i>	23
I Jurisdiction and admissibility	24
A. Decision on jurisdiction	25
B. Award	27
II Substantive protections under the Energy Charter Treaty	31
A. Legal standards	32
B. Application of legal standards	35
III Procedural issues	41
A. Document production	41
B. Provisional measures	42
C. Costs	42
 Chapter 3 - <i>Ioannis Kardassopoulos v. Georgia</i> ICSID Case No. ARB/05/18 <i>David Herlihy</i>	 45
I Introduction	45
II Caspian pipeline route selection	47
III The expropriation of the claimant's investment	49
IV The tribunal's findings	51
 Chapter 4 - AMTO case presentation <i>Dr. Sergei Voitovich, Dmitri Grischenko</i>	 55
I Interpretation by the Tribunal of the language "associated with an Economic Activity in the Energy Sector"	55

II	Tribunal's findings concerning the matter of possible attribution of the conduct of Energoatom to the State	59
III	The Parties' mutual renunciation of oral hearings.....	64
Chapter 5 -	Arbitration under the Energy Charter Treaty: recent decisions and a look to the future <i>Stephen Jagusch and Jeffrey Sullivan</i>	67
I	Recent decisions.....	68
II	Pending cases	85
III	A look to the future	89
A.	Provisional application of the ECT.....	89
B.	Denial of benefits	91
C.	The European Union and the ECT	93
Part II: BITs, the ECT and the EU:	Is Conflict Inevitable?	97
Chapter 6 -	The future of the Energy Charter Treaty in the context of the Lisbon Treaty <i>Christer Söderlund</i>	99
I	Introduction	99
A.	The future of investment arbitration in Europe	99
B.	The Energy Charter Treaty and bilateral investment treaties.....	100
II	The Energy Charter Treaty and the Lisbon Treaty – complementary or conflicting?.....	100
A.	The Energy Charter Treaty	100
B.	The Lisbon Treaty	101

C.	Does the ECT (or any BIT) have to defer to the Lisbon Treaty?	103
III	The future of investment protection under the Lisbon Treaty	104
A.	Intra-EU investment protection	106
B.	Liberalization of cross-border investment and investment protection.....	106
C.	Is investment protection by way of international arbitration necessary for the promotion of cross border investment?	107
D.	Is intra-EU investment protection “necessary”?	109
E.	Can the ECT type of investment protection be dismantled?	110
F.	Is there any official EU policy on intra-EU investment protection by way of international arbitration?.....	111
G.	Further developments	113
H.	Changing attitudes among a few Member States	114
I.	Involvement by EU in treaty negotiations; a possible scenario	114
J.	The status of the European Communities as Contracting Parties to the ECT	115
IV	The impact of European Union law on investment arbitration	117
A.	The European Commission’s involvement in the BIT negotiation process.....	118
B.	Infringement proceedings	119
C.	The EU Commission’s involvement in the arbitration process	120

D. The involvement of the ECJ in the enforcement of arbitral awards.....	122
E. Conclusion	123
Chapter 7 - The Energy Charter Treaty as a mixed agreement: a model for future European investment treaties? Markus Burgstaller	125
I Introduction	125
II The Union's foreign direct investment competence under the Treaty of Lisbon.....	129
A. Limitation to foreign direct investment.....	129
B. Further limitations of the Union's foreign direct investment competence?.....	131
C. European investment treaties: a slow start	137
III International responsibility for mixed agreements	141
A. A declaration of competence?	141
B. International responsibility without a declaration of competence	143
C. The Energy Charter Treaty model: an <i>ad hoc</i> declaration of responsibility	147
IV Conclusion.....	151
Chapter 8 - Role and responsibility of the European Union under the Energy Charter Treaty Richard Happ and Jan Asmus Bischoff.....	155
I The role of EU Law in ECT arbitral proceedings	156
II The European Union as a REIO.....	163
III The ECT as a mixed agreement under EU law	166

IV	Applicable principles of "Responsibility"	171
V	Where to invoke the responsibility	175
VI	Who can invoke the responsibility?	177
VII	Whom to sue: EU or Member States or both?	182
VIII	Conclusion	183
Part III: Provisional Application: <i>rien ne dure comme le provisoire</i>		185
Introductory remarks		
	<i>James Crawford</i>	187
Chapter 9 - Provisional application of the Energy Charter Treaty: the negotiating history of Article 45		
	<i>Yas Banifatemi</i>	191
Chapter 10 -The sun never sets: provisional application and the Energy Charter Treaty		
	<i>Alexandre de Gramont and Emily M. Alban</i>	211
I	Introduction	211
II	The significance of the ECT's provisional application: Russia and beyond	216
III	Article 45: terms and issues.....	218
IV	<i>Petrobart v. Kyrgyzstan</i> : provisional application in an unusual situation	221
V	<i>Kardassopoulos v. Georgia</i> : provisional application further considered	225
	A. Provisional application: not equivalent to entry into force	227
	B. Provisional application and national law: general questions	231
	C. Provisional application: consistent with Georgian and Greek law	233

VI	Majority shareholders of Yukos v. Russia: the most closely-watched case of provisional application.....	237
A.	Provisional application: no declaration required	239
B.	Provisional application: “all-or-nothing” vs. the “piecemeal” approach	241
C.	Provisional application and Russian law	243
VII	Conclusion.....	247
Chapter 11 –Provisional application of the Energy Charter Treaty: the conundrum		
<i>Michael Polkinghorne and Laurent Gouiffès</i>		
I	Provisional application issues	249
A.	General framework of provisional application: <i>the riddle</i>	250
B.	Provisional application in domestic law: <i>the mystery</i>	259
C.	Scope of provisional application: <i>the enigma</i>	261
II	Termination of provisional application.....	272
A.	Conditions of termination	272
B.	Effects of termination	275
Part IV: Transit Disputes, Supply Disputes and the ECT:		
Towards an East-West Thaw?		
Chapter 12 – Transit disputes, supply disputes and the ECT: towards an East-West thaw?		
Some observations from an international trade law perspective		
<i>Colin M. Brown</i>		
I	Introduction	285
II	Transit obligations.....	286

A. World Trade Organisation.....	286
B. Energy Charter Treaty.....	288
C. The Partnership and Co-operation Agreement between the Russian Federation and the European Communities and its Member States	290
III Obligations with respect to import/export restrictions	291
IV Conclusions on applicable international legal framework	292
V Limitations to the effectiveness of the legal framework	292
VI Conclusions and tentative suggestions	294
 Chapter 13 –The Energy Charter Treaty and East-West transit <i>Peter D. Cameron</i>	297
I.....	298
II.....	305
III.....	307
IV.....	310
 Chapter 14 –Russian energy policy and dispute settlement <i>Kaj I. Hobér</i>	315
I Introduction	315
II Russia’s influence on the energy sector in Europe	316
III Core elements of Russia’s energy policy.....	319
A. Mr. Vladimir Putin’s scholarly writings.....	320
B. Energy strategy	325
IV International agreements and Russia’s energy policy.....	328

A. Introduction.....	328
B. The PCA	328
C. The ECT	331
D. President Medvedev's proposal	337
V Disputes in the energy sector.....	339
A. Commercial gas disputes.....	339
B. Investment disputes	343
C. ECT transit provisions and early warning mechanisms	344
VI Possible arbitration regime for gas transit disputes.....	348
A. Introduction.....	348
B. Emergency arbitration provisions	348
C. Fast-track rules	351
D. Agreed lists of arbitrators	353
E. Selection of arbitral institution.....	354
VII Concluding remarks.....	355
Concluding Remarks	
Renewed questions in ECT investment arbitration <i>Stanimir A. Alexandrov</i>	357
I Introduction	357
II The ECT as a multilateral investment treaty	358
III Provisional application.....	361
IV Article 17(1): denial of benefits.....	364
V The ECT's future in a post-Lisbon Treaty EU	369
VI Conclusion.....	371
Index	373

CD-ROM (Appendix Topics)

The Energy Charter Treaty (ECT) and Related Documents

ICSID Convention, Regulation and Rules

ICSID Additional Facility Rules

SCC Arbitration Rules 2010

UNCITRAL Arbitration Rules 2010