

**CARBONNEAU
ON
INTERNATIONAL ARBITRATION:
COLLECTED ESSAYS**

Thomas E. Carbonneau

JURIS

Questions About This Publication

For assistance with shipments, billing or other customer service matters,
please call our Customer Services Department at:

1-631-350-2100

To obtain a copy of this book, call our Sales Department:

1-631-351-5430

Fax: 1-631-351-5712

Toll Free Order Line:

1-800-887-4064 (United States and Canada)

See our web page about this book:
www.arbitrationlaw.com

COPYRIGHT © 2011
by JurisNet, LLC

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced in any form
or by any electronic or mechanical means including information storage and
retrieval systems without permission in writing from the publisher.

Printed in the United States of America
ISBN 978-1-933833-34-7

JurisNet, LLC
71 New Street
Huntington, New York 11743 USA

To the memory of my parents:

Adrian and Lucille (Sirois) Carbonneau

SUMMARY TABLE OF CONTENTS

Preface	xv
Acknowledgements.....	xix
About the Author	xxi
PART I: INTRODUCTORY PERSPECTIVE	1
Chapter 1. The Ballad of Transborder Arbitration.....	3
Chapter 2. The Remaking of Arbitration: Design and Destiny.....	69
Chapter 3. Commercial Peace and Political Competition in the Crosshairs of International Arbitration.....	91
PART II: JUDICIALIZATION OF THE PROCESS	123
Chapter 4. National Law and the Judicialization of Arbitration: Manifest Destiny, Manifest Disregard, or Manifest Error	125
Chapter 5. Darkness and Light in the Shadows of International Arbitral Adjudication	143
PART III: THE ROLE OF NATIONAL LAW AND COURTS.....	169
Chapter 6. Judicial Approbation in Building the Civilization of Arbitration.....	171
Chapter 7. Arbitral Adjudication: A Comparative Assessment of Its Remedial and Substantive Status in Transnational Commerce	201
Chapter 8. A Commentary on the 1996 United Kingdom Arbitration Act.....	301
Chapter 9. Debating the Proper Role of National Law under the New York Arbitration Convention.....	327

PART IV: <i>STARE DECISIS</i> IN ARBITRATION	343
Chapter 10. Rendering Arbitral Awards with Reasons: The Elaboration of a Common Law of International Transactions	345
Chapter 11. Arbitral Law-Making	385
Chapter 12. The Exercise of Contract Freedom in the Making of Arbitration Agreements.....	417
PART V: LANDMARK CASES	467
Chapter 13. The Exuberant Pathway to Quixotic Internationalism: Assessing the Folly of <i>Mitsubishi</i>	469
Chapter 14. “A-Legality” and Arbitration: The German Supreme Court Joins the Fray.....	503
Index	519

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Preface	xv
Acknowledgements.....	xix
About the Author	xxi

PART I: INTRODUCTORY PERSPECTIVE

Chapter 1. The Ballad of Transborder Arbitration.....	3
I. Introduction	3
II. A Brief History	7
III. ICA in the World Community	12
IV. Latin America.....	13
V. Asia.....	17
VI. Problems and Dissenting Positions	25
VII. The Business of Arbitration.....	29
VIII. The Need for Uniformity.....	35
IX. Impact on National Law	38
X. Law and Legitimacy	40
XI. Indeterminant Embryonic Rules.....	43
XII. Internal Sovereign Conflicts.....	50
XIII. A Detailed Illustration	52
XIV. New Rule Predicates	55
XV. Codifying the New Rules	59
XVI. Conclusions	62
Chapter 2. The Remaking of Arbitration: Design and Destiny	69
I. The Advances Made	69
II. Emerging Problems	71
III. “A-National” Arbitration.....	74
IV. Private International Law	75
V. Municipal Law Support.....	78
VI. A-National Arbitration and the Lex Mercatoria	79
VII. A Further Evaluation of the Critics and the Debate	83
VIII. Conclusion: The Real Issues	87

Chapter 3. Commercial Peace and Political Competition in the Crosshairs of International Arbitration	91
I. Introduction	91
II. Origins and Character of Inter-State Relations.....	95
III. The Choice between Instinct and Reason.....	98
IV. The Liberality of Commerce	101
V. Dispute Resolution Pursuant to the Business Ethic.....	105
VI. Arbitration and Politics	112
VII. Conclusion: Arbitration's Likely Potential	118

PART II: JUDICIALIZATION OF THE PROCESS

Chapter 4. National Law and the Judicialization of Arbitration: Manifest Destiny, Manifest Disregard, or Manifest Error	125
I. Introduction	125
II. National Laws and Arbitration	127
III. The Special Case of U.S. Law.....	133
IV. The Arbitral Trial and Lawyers.....	136
V. Using the Contract of Arbitration to Protect Rights	138
VI. Conclusions	140
 Chapter 5. Darkness and Light in the Shadows of International Arbitral Adjudication	143
I. Introduction	143
II. Fact-Finding and the Advocate	146
III. Adjudication: Character, Mission, and Reality	148
IV. International Adjudication.....	149
V. The “Adversarialization” of International Arbitration and Adjudication	152
VI. Reforming Adjudication through Arbitration.....	158
VII. Conclusions	166

PART III. THE ROLE OF NATIONAL LAW AND COURTS

Chapter 6. Judicial Approbation in Building the Civilization of Arbitration	171
I. Introduction	171
II. The English Experience.....	176
III. The French Experience.....	182
IV. The U.S. Experience.....	189
V. Conclusions	196
Chapter 7. Arbitral Adjudication: A Comparative Assessment of Its Remedial and Substantive Status in Transnational Commerce	201
I. Introduction	201
II. The Domestic Reassessment	207
A. The English Experience.....	208
1. The Writ Procedure	208
2. The Arbitration Act of 1950	210
3. The Arbitration Act of 1979	213
B. The American Experience	215
1. Federal Legislation	215
2. The Uniform Arbitration Act: A Model for State Arbitration Statutes.....	221
C. <i>L'Expérience Française</i>	224
1. The Prior Posture.....	224
2. The Decree of May 14, 1980	226
III. An Assessment of the Parallel Domestic Developments.....	229
A. A Summary of the Similarities and Differences	229
B. The Motivation	231
C. Apparent Incongruities.....	232
IV. The Emergence of International Commercial Arbitration....	234
A. The English Position.....	235
B. The American Position	239
1. The <i>Scherk</i> Decision	243
2. Developments Subsequent to <i>Scherk</i>	251
C. <i>La Prise de la Position Française</i>	253
1. The Decree of May 12, 1981	253

2.	The Decisional Law.....	257
V.	An Assessment of the Parallel International Developments.....	260
VI.	Arbitration and International Conventions and Institutions.....	262
A.	The Conventions.....	264
1.	The 1958 New York Convention.....	264
a)	Scope of application.....	264
b)	Other provisions.....	265
2.	The 1961 European Convention.....	266
a)	Scope of application.....	266
b)	Other provisions.....	268
c)	The law governing the merits.....	270
d)	Grounds for setting aside an award.....	270
e)	Reasoned awards.....	271
B.	Institutional Arbitration.....	272
1.	ICC, AAA, and LCA Arbitration.....	273
2.	UNCITRAL and ICSID Arbitration.....	274
a)	Scope.....	274
b)	An evaluation.....	277
VII.	Arbitral Adjudication and the Generation of Normative Principles.....	279
A.	Reasoned Awards: A First Step toward the Elaboration of Substantive Norms.....	283
B.	An Example of a Possible Approach.....	288
VIII.	Conclusions.....	296

Chapter 8.	A Commentary on the 1996 United Kingdom Arbitration Act.....	301
I.	Introduction.....	301
II.	Basic Principles.....	302
III.	Judicial Jurisdiction to Assist Arbitration.....	304
IV.	Hierarchy of Authority.....	305
V.	The Requirement of a Writing.....	306
VI.	The Arbitration Agreement.....	306
VII.	Staying Legal Proceedings.....	307
VIII.	Maritime Arbitration.....	308

IX.	Time Limits	309
X.	The Arbitral Tribunal	309
XI.	The Arbitral Process	310
XII.	Arbitrator Liability	312
XIII.	<i>Kompetenz-Kompetenz</i>	313
XIV.	Arbitral Due Process	316
XV.	Arbitrator Authority	317
XVI.	Judicial Supervision	319
XVII.	The Award	322
XVIII.	Remedies	323
XIX.	Miscellaneous	323
XX.	Conclusion	325
Chapter 9. Debating the Proper Role of National Law under the New York Arbitration Convention		
		327
I.	The <i>Chromalloy</i> Opinion	328
II.	The <i>Toys “R” Us</i> Opinion	333
III.	Conclusions	340

PART IV. *STARE DECISIS* IN ARBITRATION

Chapter 10. Rendering Arbitral Awards with Reasons: The Elaboration of a Common Law of International Transactions		
		345
I.	Reassessing the Role of Reasoned Awards in International Arbitral Practice	347
II.	The Results Achieved with Reasoned Awards in Actual Practice	354
A.	Maritime Arbitration	354
B.	International Chamber of Commerce Arbitration	355
1.	Good Faith	357
2.	Mitigation of Damages	358
3.	Renegotiation	359
4.	Other Rules	361
5.	Stature of the Rules	364

III.	Advocating the Adoption of Reasoned Awards	366
A.	Preliminary Observations.....	366
B.	The Substance of the Recommendation.....	367
IV.	A Critical Evaluation of the Recommendation	368
A.	Arguments against Reasoned Awards.....	368
B.	Arguments Favoring Reasoned Awards	372
1.	The Needs of the International Process.....	372
2.	The Consensus Surrounding the Process	375
V.	Conclusions	380
Chapter 11. Arbitral Law-Making.....		385
I.	Introduction	385
II.	The Foibles of Municipal Adjudication	390
III.	The Arbitral Solution.....	400
IV.	The Arbitral Legal Culture	406
V.	The Arbitral <i>Lex Mercatoria</i>	409
VI.	Prospective Arbitral Practice.....	414
Chapter 12. The Exercise of Contract Freedom in the Making of Arbitration Agreements.....		417
I.	Introduction: Contract’s Empire in Arbitration	417
II.	The Effect and Development of Arbitration Agreements.....	429
III.	The Questions Presented	434
IV.	The Content of “Modern” Arbitration Agreements.....	435
A.	The Recourse to Arbitration: Voluntary, Necessary, or Coerced?.....	435
B.	Institutional Arbitration	436
C.	Selecting Arbitrators and the Question of Impartiality	439
D.	Arbitrator Accountability and Collegiality	444
E.	Controlling Authority in the Arbitration.....	448
F.	Governing Law	450
G.	The Character of the Arbitral Trial	453
H.	The Award	453
I.	The Standard of Review.....	454
J.	The <i>Chromalloy</i> Problem.....	456

K. Foreign Practice Rules	458
L. The “Universal” Jurisdiction of National Courts in Transborder Arbitration	463
V. Conclusions	464

PART V: LANDMARK CASES

Chapter 13. The Exuberant Pathway to Quixotic Internationalism: Assessing the Folly of <i>Mitsubishi</i>	469
I. The Groundwork for the Decision.....	469
II. Seeking a Measure of Restraint	472
III. Arbitrability	474
IV. The Initial Determination	476
V. Assessing the Appellate Reasoning.....	480
VI. The Oracular Injunctive Reaffirmed	480
A. The Methodology	481
B. Statutory Rights	481
C. The Central Issue	483
D. An Appraisal of the Consequences.....	486
E. Abating Concerns through a Merits Review?	487
F. The “Prospective Waiver” Example	489
G. The Dissent	492
VII. In the Aftermath	494
VIII. Conclusions	500
Chapter 14. “A-Legality” and Arbitration: The German Supreme Court Joins the Fray	503
I. Preface	503
II. The Opinion and Its Setting.....	504
III. The Facts	507
IV. An Assessment of the Facts.....	508
V. Procedural History.....	509
VI. The Opinion.....	510
VII. A Wider Assessment	513
VIII. Conclusion.....	516
Index	519

