

**CARBONNEAU ON ARBITRATION:  
COLLECTED ESSAYS**

**Thomas E. Carbonneau**

**JURIS**

### **Questions About This Publication**

For assistance with shipments, billing or other customer service matters,  
please call our Customer Services Department at:

1-631-350-2100

To obtain a copy of this book, call our Sales Department:

1-631-351-5430

Fax: 1-631-351-5712

Toll Free Order Line:

1-800-887-4064 (United States and Canada)

See our web page about this book:

[www.arbitrationlaw.com](http://www.arbitrationlaw.com)

COPYRIGHT © 2010  
by JurisNet, LLC

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced in any form  
or by any electronic or mechanical means including information storage and  
retrieval systems without permission in writing from the publisher.

---

Printed in the United States of America  
ISBN 978-1-933833-35-4

---

JurisNet, LLC  
71 New Street  
Huntington, New York 11743  
USA  
[www.arbitrationlaw.com](http://www.arbitrationlaw.com)

**To my daughter:**

**Sara L. Carbonneau  
“Lou”**



## SUMMARY TABLE OF CONTENTS

Table of Contents .....	vii
Preface .....	xiii
Acknowledgements.....	xv
About the Author .....	xvii
<b>PART I: GENERAL PERSPECTIVES.....</b>	<b>1</b>
Chapter 1. The Revolution in Law through Arbitration.....	3
Chapter 2. The Story of Arbitration Law .....	51
Chapter 3. The Reception of Arbitration in United States Law .....	77
<b>PART II: CRITICAL THEMES .....</b>	<b>105</b>
Chapter 4. At the Crossroads of Legitimacy and Arbitral Autonomy .....	107
Chapter 5. Beyond Trilogies: A New Bill of Rights and Law Practice through Arbitration .....	163
Chapter 6. Arbitral Justice: The Demise of Due Process in American Law .....	201
<b>PART III: ASSESSING THE PROCESS.....</b>	<b>225</b>
Chapter 7. Arguments in Favor of the Triumph of Arbitration.....	227
Chapter 8. Commentary on Developments in U.S. Arbitration Law .....	257
<b>PART IV: REFORMING THE PROCESS.....</b>	<b>349</b>
Chapter 9. Arbitration and the U.S. Supreme Court: A Plea for Statutory Reform.....	351
Chapter 10. “Arbitracide”: The Story of Anti-Arbitration Sentiment in the U.S. Congress.....	403

<b>PART V: LANDMARK CASES</b> .....	459
Chapter 11. Excerpts of Writings on Arbitration: An Introduction and Commentary on Recent U.S. Supreme Court Cases .....	461
Chapter 12. <i>Hall Street Associates, LLC v. Mattel, Inc.</i> : A New Englander’s Tale of Statutory Supremacy in Arbitration Law .....	493
<b>Index</b> .....	515

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

Preface .....	xiii
Acknowledgements.....	xv
About the Author .....	xvii

### PART I: GENERAL PERSPECTIVES

<b>Chapter 1. The Revolution in Law through Arbitration.....</b>	<b>3</b>
I. Introduction .....	3
II. Historical Antecedents.....	16
III. The FAA.....	17
IV. The Post- <i>Erie</i> FAA.....	22
V. The Impact of Collective Bargaining Agreement Arbitration.....	26
VI. The Influence of Transborder Arbitration .....	29
VII. The New Forms of Arbitration .....	33
VIII. Arbitrator Sovereignty.....	35
IX. The Legitimacy of the Federal Policy on Arbitration .....	38
X. Evaluating the Federal Policy.....	40
XI. Conclusions .....	45
<b>Chapter 2. The Story of Arbitration Law.....</b>	<b>51</b>
I. Introduction .....	51
II. Multi-Faceted Narrative .....	52
III. The Decisional Law .....	53
IV. Arbitration and ADR as a Deconstruction of Law.....	59
V. Assessing the Current Status of Arbitration .....	64
VI. Standards and Protection through Education .....	66
VII. Arbitration's Political Dimension.....	70
VIII. Possible Reforms.....	74
IX. Conclusion.....	76

<b>Chapter 3. The Reception of Arbitration in United States Law</b> .....	77
I. Introduction .....	77
II. The Early View of Arbitration.....	81
III. Arbitration Rehabilitated .....	83
IV. The International Case Law.....	88
V. The Fusion of Doctrine.....	96
VI. Conclusions .....	100
<b>PART II: CRITICAL THEMES</b>	
<b>Chapter 4. At the Crossroads of Legitimacy and Arbitral Autonomy</b> .....	107
I. Introduction .....	107
II. The U.S. Law on Enforcement .....	117
III. The Impartiality of Arbitrators: The Sole Court-Sanctioned Constraint .....	126
IV. Vacatur as an Abridgement of Arbitral Confidentiality .....	130
V. Expanding Constricted “Manifest Disregard” .....	136
VI. Possible Change.....	141
VII. Freedom of Contract Innovation: Opt-In Provisions .....	144
VIII. A Judicial Addition: The Action to Clarify Awards.....	147
IX. Conclusions .....	156
<b>Chapter 5. Beyond Trilogies: A New Bill of Rights and Law Practice through Arbitration</b> .....	163
I. Introduction .....	163
II. Affirming the Policy of Federalization ( <i>Terminix</i> and <i>Mastrobuono</i> ).....	166
III. Revisiting Internationalism ( <i>Vimar</i> ).....	175
IV. The Contract of Arbitration as Law ( <i>Kaplan</i> ) .....	180
V. Exploring the Contractualist View .....	186
VI. The New Lawyering .....	191
VII. Conclusions .....	197



<b>Chapter 6. Arbitral Justice: The Demise of Due Process in American Law</b> .....	201
I. The Arbitral Process: An Introductory Definition.....	201
II. Historical and Contemporary Standing of the Arbitral Remedy .....	202
III. The U.S. Arbitration Act .....	205
IV. Federalism and Larger Judicial Design for Arbitration .....	207
A. Enter the U.S. Supreme Court.....	208
B. The March Begins.....	209
C. A Critique .....	213
V. Arbitration and ADR .....	216
VI. Conclusions .....	219
<b>PART III. ASSESSING THE PROCESS</b>	
<b>Chapter 7. Arguments in Favor of the Triumph of Arbitration</b> .....	227
I. Introduction .....	227
II. The Fairness of Adhesionary Arbitration .....	230
III. Debt Collection Cases .....	235
IV. Corporate Duality in the Use of Arbitration .....	236
V. <i>La Bête Noire</i> .....	238
VI. Attacking the Beast.....	240
VII. Classwide Arbitration.....	245
VIII. A Trinity of Intractable Problems.....	246
IX. Possible Solutions to the Lack of Contract Fairness.....	247
X. International Arbitration.....	250
XI. Conclusions .....	255
<b>Chapter 8. Commentary on Developments in U.S. Arbitration Law</b> .....	257
I. “Triangular” Arbitration Agreement Held Unenforceable .....	257
II. Litigious Conduct in Arbitration .....	263

III.	Third Circuit Endorses Contractual “Opt-In” Provisions while Vacating an Award for Excess of Arbitral Authority.....	267
IV.	U.S. Supreme Court Holds That FAA § 1 Employment Contract Exclusion Applies Only to Workers Directly Involved in Interstate Transport: Employers Can Require All Other Employees to Arbitrate Employment Disputes .....	274
V.	A Critique of the Uniform Arbitration Act (2000) .....	279
	A. Important Issues.....	279
	B. Additional Issues.....	313
	1. Section 21 .....	313
	2. Section 7(c).....	314
	3. Section 8 .....	314
	4. Section 9 .....	316
	5. Section 10 .....	317
	6. Section 6 .....	321
	C. Issues Not Addressed in the UAA .....	326
	1. Adhesionary and Unconscionable Arbitration Agreements .....	327
	2. “Opt-In” Provisions .....	328
	3. Challenges to the Validity of Awards .....	329
	D. Concluding Thoughts on the UAA .....	330
VI.	California Supreme Court Decides <i>Armendariz</i> .....	331
	A. The Case .....	331
	B. The Essential Elements .....	332
	C. Damages.....	333
	D. Discovery.....	334
	E. Judicial Review and Written Findings .....	334
	F. Bearing the Cost .....	335
	G. Unconscionability .....	336
VII.	Second Circuit Expands Judicial Scrutiny of Arbitral Awards.....	338
VIII.	The Scope of the FAA and the Enforcement of Non-Arbitral ADR Mechanisms: Two Views .....	342
IX.	A Comment on <i>Borsack</i> .....	344

## PART IV. REFORMING THE PROCESS

<b>Chapter 9. Arbitration and the U.S. Supreme Court:</b>	
<b>A Plea for Statutory Reform</b> .....	351
I. Introduction .....	351
II. Arbitration and the Litigation Crisis.....	355
III. The History of Arbitration: The Distance between Distrust, Acceptance, and Federalization .....	362
A. Arriving at the Apogee of Judicial Liberalism .....	366
B. <i>McMahon</i> : The Epigee of the Liberal Doctrine .....	373
C. The Likely Consequences and Possible Motives .....	374
IV. Reactions to <i>McMahon</i> .....	378
A. <i>Volt</i> : A Note of Dissonance .....	383
B. <i>Rodriguez</i> : A Reaffirmation .....	388
V. Reasserting Juridical Control over Arbitration.....	394
VI. Conclusion.....	401
<b>Chapter 10. “Arbitracide”: The Story of Anti-Arbitration Sentiment in the U.S. Congress</b> .....	
I. Introduction: The U.S. Supreme Court and Arbitration .....	403
II. Disparate-Party Arbitration .....	409
III. Golden State Animosity.....	410
IV. The Weapon of Legislation .....	414
V. The Latest Legislative Instrument .....	418
VI. The Findings.....	422
VII. A General Assessment of the Findings.....	436
VIII. The Change to the FAA.....	437
IX. The Sessions Bill .....	442
X. Recent Developments .....	452
XI. Conclusion.....	454

## PART V. LANDMARK CASES

<b>Chapter 11. Excerpts of Writings on Arbitration: An Introduction and Commentary on Recent U.S. Supreme Court Cases</b>	461
I. Introduction: The Rise of Arbitration	461
II. Presumptive Contract Validity	463
III. The Rule of Federal Law	464
IV. Unobstructed Arbitrability	465
V. The Imperial Federal Judicial Policy	466
VI. Arbitrator Impartiality and Disclosures	469
VII. The Golden Age	472
VIII. Adhesionary Arbitration	473
IX. Judicialization	475
X. The Fate of “Opt-In” Agreements	475
XI. The Action to Clarify Awards and the Imposition of Sanctions for Specious Litigation	478
XII. Commentary on Recent Cases	479
<b>Chapter 12. <i>Hall Street Associates, LLC v. Mattel, Inc.</i>: A New Englander’s Tale of Statutory Supremacy in Arbitration Law</b>	493
I. Introduction	493
II. The Agreement	497
III. The Court’s View of the FAA	498
IV. The Circuit Split	500
V. The Discussion of Manifest Disregard	502
VI. Immovability of the Statutory Text	504
VII. The Bluster of the <i>Amici</i>	506
VIII. Justice Scalia’s Objection to Footnote Seven	507
IX. Delphic Dicta	507
X. The Dissents	509
XI. Conclusions	510
<b>Index</b>	515