The Enforcement of Foreign Arbitral Awards in Russia

Eleven Years of Commercial Court Practice Applying the New York Convention

William R. Spiegelberger

JURIS
Questions About This Publication

For assistance with shipments, billing or other customer service matters, please call our Customer Services Department at:

1-631-350-2100

To obtain a copy of this book, call our Sales Department:

1-631-351-5430
Fax: 1-631-351-5712

Toll Free Order Line:

1-800-887-4064 (United States & Canada)

See our web page about this book:
www.arbitrationlaw.com

COPYRIGHT © 2014
JurisNet, LLC

All Rights Reserved.
Printed in the United States of America.

JurisNet, LLC
71 New Street
Huntington, New York 11743
USA
www.arbitrationlaw.com
**SUMMARY TABLE OF CONTENTS**

Preface ............................................................................................................................... xiii
Abbreviations ..................................................................................................................... xv
Note on Translation ........................................................................................................... xix
Introduction ....................................................................................................................... xxi

I. Overview of the Enforcing Court System .............................................................. 1

II. Laws and Treaties Applicable to Enforcement .................................................... 7

III. NY Convention Article V(1)(a): Party Incapacity or Invalid Agreement to Arbitrate .......................................................... 23

IV. NY Convention Article V(1)(b): Improper Notice or Inability to Present Case .......................................................... 37

V. NY Convention Article V(1)(c): The Award Deals with a Difference not Contemplated by the Submission to Arbitration or Contains Decisions on Matters Beyond the Scope of the Submission ........................................... 61

VI. NY Convention Article V(1)(d): The Composition of Tribunal or the Procedure Was Not in Accordance with Party Agreement or with the Law of the Place of Arbitration ........................................ 69

VII. NY Convention Article V(1)(e): The Award Is Not Binding or Has Been Set Aside or Suspended ........................................ 73

VIII. NY Convention Article V(2)(a): The Subject Matter of the Difference is Not Capable of Settlement by Arbitration under the law of the Russian Federation ........................................ 79

IX. NY Convention Article V(2)(b): Violation of the Public Policy of the Russian Federation .................................................. 85
THE ENFORCEMENT OF FOREIGN ARBITRAL AWARDS IN RUSSIA

Afterword ............................................................................................................ 125

Appendices

A. Convention on the Recognition and Enforcement of Foreign Arbitral Awards (New York, 1958) ............ 129


C. Treaty on the Manner of Resolving Disputes in the Area of Commercial Activity (Kiev, 1992) ............ 147

D. Section III (Articles 51-55) of the Convention on Legal Assistance and Legal Relations in Civil, Family, and Criminal Matters (Minsk, 1993) .......... 155

E. Convention on the Resolution by Arbitration of Civil Law Disputes in the Area of Economic and Scientific-Technical Cooperation (Moscow, 1972) .... 159


G. Chapters 30-33 of the Code of Procedure of the Commercial Court of the Russian Federation (2002) ... 185

H. Informational Letter of the Presidium of the Supreme Commercial Court of the Russian Federation No. 96 (2005) ............................................ 211

I. Informational Letter of the Presidium of the Supreme Commercial Court of the Russian Federation No. 156 (2013) ....................................................... 263

J. Table of Commercial Court Cases Granting or Denying Enforcement of Foreign Arbitral Awards 2003-2013 ................................................................. 285

K. Tables of Enforcement Rates by Year, Type of Award, and Defense(s) to Enforcement Pledged ......... 307

Index...................................................................................................................... 311
# Detailed Table of Contents

Preface .................................................................................................................. xiii
Abbreviations ........................................................................................................ xv
Note on Translation ............................................................................................... xix
Introduction ........................................................................................................... xxi

## I. Overview of the Enforcing Court System ........................................ 1

A. The Commercial Court Branch .......................................................... 1
B. The Commercial Courts of Subjects of the Russian Federation ........ 2
C. The Appellate Commercial Courts ..................................................... 4
D. The Commercial Courts of the Circuits .............................................. 4
E. The Supreme Court of the Russian Federation .................................... 5

## II. Laws and Treaties Applicable to Enforcement .............................. 7

A. The Code of Procedure of the Commercial Court ......................... 7
B. The ICA Law and NY Convention .................................................... 12
C. The NY Convention: Russian Peculiarities ........................................ 15
D. The European Convention ............................................................... 17
E. The Kiev Treaty ................................................................................... 18
F. The Minsk Convention ......................................................................... 19
G. The Moscow Convention ................................................................. 19
H. An Exemplary Case ............................................................................. 20
III. NY Convention Article V(1)(a): Party Incapacity or Invalid Agreement to Arbitrate .................................................. 23
   A. Forged Signature .......................................................... 23
   B. Signature Authority ...................................................... 25
   C. Faulty Arbitration Clause ............................................. 25
   D. Amendment to Arbitration Clause................................. 28
   E. Assignment of Right to Arbitrate ................................. 29
   F. Contract Brokered by Email ......................................... 32
   G. Expired Contract ......................................................... 34
   H. Branch Office Lacking Capacity .................................... 34

IV. NY Convention Article V(1)(b): Improper Notice or Inability to Present Case ........................................................ 37
   A. Mutual Legal Assistance Treaties ................................ 38
   B. The Hague Service Convention .................................... 41
   C. The Kiev Treaty ............................................................ 44
   D. CPCC Articles 244(1)(2) and 242(3)(3) ....................... 46
   E. Partial Notice ............................................................. 48
   F. Authority to Accept Notice ......................................... 52
   G. Burden of Proof ......................................................... 55
   H. Email Notice ............................................................. 58
   I. Inability to Attend Hearing .......................................... 58
### DETAILED TABLE OF CONTENTS

**V. NY Convention Article V(1)(c): The Award Deals with a Difference not Contemplated by the Submission to Arbitration or Contains Decisions on Matters Beyond the Scope of the Submission** ........................................... 61  
A. Scope of Damages .......................................................... 62  
B. Appendix to Contract ................................................... 64  
C. Related Contracts ......................................................... 66  

**VI. NY Convention Article V(1)(d): The Composition of Tribunal or the Procedure Was Not in Accordance with Party Agreement or with the Law of the Place of Arbitration** ......................................................... 69  
A. Appointing Authority ................................................... 69  
B. Objection to Procedure ................................................. 71  
C. Acquiescence in Deviation ........................................... 72  

**VII. NY Convention Article V(1)(e): The Award Is Not Binding or Has Been Set Aside or Suspended** .................... 73  
A. ICC Rule (1998) 28(6) ................................................. 74  
B. Belarusian Law ............................................................. 75  
C. Burden of Proof ............................................................ 76  
D. Cost Award ................................................................... 76  
E. Conservatory Measures ................................................ 77  
F. Partial Setting Aside ..................................................... 78  

**VIII. NY Convention Article V(2)(a): The Subject Matter of the Difference is Not Capable of Settlement by Arbitration under the law of the Russian Federation** ...... 79  
A. Legal Framework: Non-Arbitral Matters ......................... 79  
B. Russian Law of Mandatory Application ......................... 81
THE ENFORCEMENT OF FOREIGN ARBITRAL AWARDS IN RUSSIA

IX. NY Convention Article V(2)(b): Violation of the Public Policy of the Russian Federation ........................................ 85
   A. Legislative Pronouncements........................................ 85
   B. Informational Letter No. 156....................................... 87
   C. Prior Russian Judgment Invalidating Contract: The “Russian Defense”......................................................... 90
   D. Symmetric Optional Dispute Resolution Clause............ 98
   E. Asymmetric Optional Dispute Resolution Clause........... 99
   F. No Liability without Fault........................................ 102
   G. Joint Marital Property.............................................. 104
   H. Bankrupt Debtor Party.............................................. 106
   I. Typographical Error in Award ................................... 109
   J. Bad Faith and Unconscionable Conduct .................... 110
   K. Damages in Non-Russian Currency ........................... 112
   L. Forged Contract..................................................... 112
   M. Liquidated Damages and Interest ............................. 113

Afterword ........................................................................... 125

Appendices
   A. Convention on the Recognition and Enforcement of Foreign Arbitral Awards (New York, 1958)........... 129
   C. Treaty on the Manner of Resolving Disputes in the Area of Commercial Activity (Kiev, 1992).............. 147
   D. Section III (Articles 51-55) of the Convention on Legal Assistance and Legal Relations in Civil, Family, and Criminal Matters (Minsk, 1993)............ 155
## DETAILED TABLE OF CONTENTS

E. Convention on the Resolution by Arbitration of Civil Law Disputes in the Area of Economic and Scientific-Technical Cooperation (Moscow, 1972) .... 159


H. Informational Letter of the Presidium of the Supreme Commercial Court of the Russian Federation No. 96 (2005) ......................................................... 211

I. Informational Letter of the Presidium of the Supreme Commercial Court of the Russian Federation No. 156 (2013) ......................................................... 263

J. Table of Commercial Court Cases Granting or Denying Enforcement of Foreign Arbitral Awards 2003-2013 ................................................................. 285

K. Tables of Enforcement Rates by Year, Type of Award, and Defense(s) to Enforcement Pleadex ........ 307

Index ........................................................................................................... 311